

الحجّة الغرّاء

على شهادة الزهراء عليها السلام

Al-Hujjatul gharraa' 'ala shahaadatil Zahraa' alaiha as-salaam
**The Compelling Evidence on the Martyrdom
of Al-Zahra (peace be upon her)**

A concise study shedding light on the converging reports that discuss what happened to her after the departure of the Noble Messenger, may peace and blessings be upon him and his family.

By Ayatollah Ja'far Sobhani

Translated by Lukorios



Done with the help of Chat GPT



The bitter events following the departure of the Prophet, may Allah's peace and blessings be upon him and his family

Winds of tribulations blew upon the Muslims after the death of the Prophet, may Allah's peace and blessings be upon him and his family, and they were sifted thoroughly until the steadfast believer in his faith distinguished himself from the hypocrite who concealed himself behind the facade of Islam. Thus, the truth of the Almighty's words was realized:

***'Muhammad is not but a messenger. [Other] messengers have passed on before him. So if he was to die or be killed, would you turn back on your heels [to unbelief]? And he who turns back on his heels will never harm Allah at all but Allah will reward the grateful.'* [3:144]**

These severe tribulations among the Muslims resulted in the emergence of knots and grudges towards the family of prophethood, may peace be upon them. Allah purified them from filth and cleansed them thoroughly, with Imam Ali ibn Abi Talib, peace be upon him, at the forefront, whose caliphate is explicitly mentioned in various sources.¹

It was necessary for the Muslims to adhere to the guidelines of the Prophet, may Allah's peace and blessings be upon him and his family, in appointing the Commander of the Believers as their leader after his departure, seek shelter under his banner, and avoid conflicts that threatened the existence of the Islamic state. This state was still under serious internal and external threats.

¹ Among them: the Day of the Residence, following the descent of His saying, Glorified be He: ***"And warn, [O Muhammad], your closest kindred."* [26:214].**

And among them: the day he left the city towards Tabuk, he said to Ali, "Would you not be pleased to be to me as Aaron was to Moses, except that there is no prophet after me?"

And among them is the day of Ghadir, where he informed the Muslims collectively about the leadership of Ali and his caliphate after him in a significant gathering that cannot be denied. For details, refer to the books written on this subject.

Internally, the hypocritical party was spreading seeds of enmity and hatred among the Muslims, aiming to achieve its goals by overthrowing the Islamic state and eliminating its leader, the Prophet, may Allah's peace and blessings be upon him and his family. They lurked around Muslim circles, waiting to pounce on them, persisting in this manner until the Messenger of Allah, may Allah's peace and blessings be upon him and his family, passed away, and Allah chose him to be by His side.

It is strange that Abu Sufyan extended his hand to Imam Ali, the Commander of the Believers, peace be upon him, for allegiance while preparing the Prophet, may Allah's peace and blessings be upon him and his family, for burial, saying:

"By Allah, I see a rebellion that can only be extinguished by blood, O family of Abd Manaf, regarding what Abu Bakr has assumed among your affairs. Where are the two oppressed ones? Where are the two humiliated ones, Ali and Abbas? He said, 'O Abu Al-Hassan, extend your hand so that I may pledge allegiance to you.'"

So Ali refused and reproached him, saying:

"Indeed, by Allah, you only intended with this to cause discord, and by Allah, your desire for evil against Islam has been prolonged. We have no need for your advice."²

Ali, may peace be upon him, stood firm against the deceit in his character and the evil in his intentions. It was clear that he (Abu Sufyan) and his followers from the hypocrites were planning to attack Islam and eliminate it if the opportunity presented itself.

The party of hypocrisy, which Allah expressed the extent of their danger to Islam through numerous revealed verses exposing their plans, still thrived in and around the city, waiting for the opportunity to undermine Islam within its circles.

This was the internal danger. As for the external threat, the danger of the Romans posed a threat to the existence of Islam. They had close ties with the party of hypocrisy. Their attack on Medina was not far from people's minds, and it did not escape the thoughts of the Prophet, peace and blessings be upon him. Even on his deathbed, he warned his companions to join the army led by Usama bin Zaid to face their fronts. He urged them to go whenever he woke up from his illness, cursing those who lagged behind and saying:

"Join the army of Usama. May Allah curse those who do not go with him."³

There was a third factor that was a source of concern for anyone whose heart beats for Islam, and that was the rebellion of the tribes neighboring Medina, where they were on the brink of apostasy to avoid paying Zakat and taxes to the central government.

These three factors, any one of which is sufficient to cause anxiety and disturbance, became a reason for Imam Ali (peace be upon him) to withhold his right and remain silent in the face of the conspiracies woven in the Saqifah. If the Imam insisted on assuming the Caliphate and engaging in war to achieve his goal, it is not far-fetched that the opportunity

² Tareekh al-Tabari: 2/449, Events of the year 11 AH.

³ Al-Shahrastani: Al-Milal wal-Nihal: 1/23; Ibn Abi al-Hadid: Sharh Nahj al-Balagha: 2/20, Egypt edition.

would be seized by hypocrites to sow discord, leading to the Roman invasion of Medina and the eradication of Islam. The Imam acknowledged these difficult matters calling for silence in some of his sermons, saying: 'By Allah, it never occurred to me, and I never imagined, that after the Prophet the Arabs would snatch away the caliphate from his Ahlul Bayt, nor that they would take it away from me after him, but I suddenly noticed people surrounding the man to swear him allegiance. I therefore withheld my hand till I saw that many people were reverting from Islam and trying to destroy the religion of Muhammad (may Allah bless him and his descendants). I then feared that if I did not protect Islam and its people and there occurred in it a breach or destruction, it would mean a greater blow to me than the loss of power over you which was, in any case, to last for a few days of which everything would pass away as the mirage passes away, or as the cloud scuds away. Therefore, in these happenings I rose till wrong was destroyed and disappeared, and religion attained peace and safety.'⁴

The Prophet (peace be upon him and his family) used to foresee, with the light of Allah, some of the dangers that would threaten Ali (peace be upon him) and his family after his departure.

Al-Hakim mentioned in his Mustadrak that the Prophet, may peace and blessings be upon him and his family, said to Ali, may peace be upon him: "You will face difficulties after me." Ali, may peace be upon him, asked: "In the safety of my religion?" The Prophet, may peace and blessings be upon him, replied: "In the safety of your religion."⁵

And al-Muhibb al-Tabari narrated that the Prophet, may peace and blessings be upon him and his family, said to Ali, may peace be upon him: "There will be resentments in the hearts of some people that will not be apparent except after me."⁶

In another statement by the Prophet, may peace and blessings be upon him and his family: "O Ali, you will be tested after me, so do not fight."⁷

These narrations indicate that the Prophet, may peace and blessings be upon him and his family, was aware of the collaboration of the Ummah in usurping the rights of Imam Ali, may peace be upon him. Therefore, he advised him to be patient and perseverant without resorting to violence against the people.

The Saqifah and the events that accompanied it

The Ansar convened to hold the Saqifah conference to discuss who would lead the government after the departure of the Prophet, may peace and blessings be upon him. Sa'd bin Ubadah and his clan were at the forefront of this gathering.

However, a question arises: What were the reasons that prompted them to convene the Saqifah conference at such an early time?

⁴ Nahj al-Balagha, from his letter (peace be upon him) to the people of Egypt, number 62.

⁵ Mustadrak al-Hakim: 3/140, and it was also authenticated by al-Dhahabi.

⁶ Muhibb al-Din al-Tabari: Riyadh al-Nadrah: 2/210.

⁷ Kanz al-Daqa'iq: by al-Munawi: 188.

To answer this, it is necessary to point out that there were concerns among the Ansar (Supporters) regarding the Muhajireen (Emigrants). This is because they had killed a significant number of the Muhajireen in the battles of Badr and Uhud. The Ansar feared that the Muhajireen might ascend to the platform of leadership and engage in oppression and persecution against them as revenge for what had happened. These fears led them to convene a conference to appoint the caliph from among themselves to safeguard against the bitter incidents that they might face at the hands of the Muhajireen.

The tribes of Aws and Khazraj gathered at the Saqifah of Banu Sa'ida. Sa'd ibn Ubadah, the leader of the Khazraj, stood up extolling the virtues of the Ansar and said:

"O assembly of the Ansar, you have precedence in religion and excellence in Islam. It is not for any Arab tribe that Muhammad, peace be upon him and his family, stayed among them for a few years, inviting them to worship the Most Merciful, to abandon idols and false gods. Only a few men from his people believed in him, and they were not able to prevent the Messenger of Allah, nor could they support his religion, nor could they protect themselves from the harm they suffered. When virtue came to you, he brought honor to you and singled you out for grace. Allah granted you faith in Him and His Messenger, support for him and his companions, exaltation for him and his religion, and jihad against his enemies. You became the strongest people against his enemy among yourselves and the heaviest burden upon his enemy compared to others. Until the Arabs submitted willingly or unwillingly to the command of Allah, and the distant was subdued while the nearby resisted, until Allah enriched His Messenger with the land through you, and the Arabs submitted with your swords. Allah fulfilled His promise to His Messenger while you were pleased with him, and your eyes were content. Through this matter, you dominated over the people."⁸

Sa'd ibn Ubadah used to give a sermon in the courtyard of the Banu Sa'ida, while all the Muhajireen were bewildered, consulting on appointing a burial place for the Prophet, peace be upon him and his family, and how to prepare, wash, and offer prayers for him. Suddenly, two individuals, Ma'n ibn Adi and Awaim ibn Sa'ida, approached, whispering in Abu Bakr's ear that the Ansar had gathered in the Sa'ida courtyard to appoint a caliph. At that moment, Abu Bakr, Umar, and Abu Ubaidah withdrew from the group of Muhajireen without uttering a word, keeping their purpose and intentions to themselves until they reached the Sa'ida courtyard. Sa'd was reclining on a mat, leaning on a pillow, giving a sermon.

Umar wanted to speak, but Abu Bakr restrained him, and he spoke, saying:

"We, the Muhajireen, were the first to embrace Islam, the most honorable in lineage, the middle in dwelling, the best in appearance, and we have experienced the mercy of the Messenger of Allah. You, our brothers in Islam and partners in religion, supported and comforted us, so may Allah reward you well. We are the leaders, and you are the ministers."⁹

Although Sa'd ibn Ubadah and Abu Bakr had spoken, highlighting their virtues and honor, the question arises as to why the vote took place, and Abu Bakr's name was drawn!

⁸ History of Tabari, 2/455-456.

⁹ Al-'Iqd Al-Fareed: 4/86, Publications of Dar and Maktabat Al-Hilal, Beirut.

The answer is that Bashir ibn Sa'd, the cousin of Sa'd ibn Ubadah, envied his cousin and believed that he was very close to the caliphate and leadership. Bashir delivered a speech in favor of the Quraysh and asked the Ansar to relinquish their claim to the caliphate, saying:

"O people of the Ansar, by Allah, if we are more virtuous in the struggle against the polytheists and pioneers in this religion, we only seek the pleasure of our Lord and the obedience of our Prophet... until he said: Indeed, Muhammad is from the Quraysh, and his people have more right to him. By Allah, Allah will not see me disputing them over this matter forever. So fear Allah and do not oppose them or dispute with them."

Then he stood up and pledged allegiance to Abu Bakr.

The pledge of allegiance (bay'ah) was foreseen by Al-Habbab ibn Mundhir when he invited Bashir ibn Sa'd to this allegiance. He addressed him, saying, "O Bashir ibn Sa'd, you have committed a grave error in what you have done. You have relinquished the leadership to your cousin."¹⁰

When the Aws witnessed what Bashir ibn Sa'd had done, and the Quraysh did not invite them, nor did the Khazraj seek Sa'd ibn Ubadah's leadership, some among them said to each other, "By Allah, if the Khazraj takes control over it (leadership) once, they will still have the upper hand over you in that virtue." So their leader, Usayd ibn Hudayr, stood up and pledged allegiance to Abu Bakr. This became the catalyst for the allegiance of his tribe, one after the other. Sa'd ibn Ubadah and the Khazraj denied what they had collectively agreed upon regarding his leadership.

Abu Bakr was content with the allegiance of the Aws, and they left the courtyard, heading to the mosque, taking allegiance from everyone they encountered on the way until they reached the mosque.¹¹

Let's leave aside the tumult, uproar, beating, and cursing that occurred in the courtyard, as the events there are filled with agitation.

The allegiance was taken willingly and unwillingly, and Ali (peace be upon him) and his household were preparing for the Prophet's (peace and blessings be upon him and his family) funeral. If only the caliph and his followers had contented themselves with what had happened. However, they attempted to force and threaten Ali and his household to take the allegiance by force, and this happened when a group of Banu Hashim men gathered at Ali's house, objecting to this type of allegiance.

There have emerged extremely bitter incidents, and a section of historians has chosen to remain silent about narrating them, out of fear, awe, or perhaps out of flattery and greed.

Some who adopted a biased stance in religion recorded those events briefly, and they fall into two categories:

¹⁰ History of Tabari: 2/457-458.

¹¹ See History of Tabari: 2/458.

A. Those who limited themselves to what transpired between Ali and the Hashemite household, involving Umar, from pleas, protests, and threats.

B. Those who unveiled what Umar ibn Al-Khattab did, from forcibly asking for allegiance to the burning and breaking of the door and the subsequent incidents.

Here we mention the words of both parties to make it known that the account of the door and the testimony of the Prophet's daughter as a result of those disturbances are not a historical myth but a historical reality.

I have read recently an article by some new writers, in which they conveyed something about the virtues of Fatimah (peace be upon her) to serve as evidence for what they want to prove, namely that the testimony of Fatimah (peace be upon her) is a historical myth with no basis in reality. A closer examination of the article reveals that the author lacks expertise in history, and his preconceived opinion led him to deny the shining truth. For this reason, we have decided to present reliable sources to the reader to substantiate her testimony and refute the violation of her sanctity.

Our discussion revolves around three axes:

The first: The infallibility of Fatimah (peace be upon her) in the words of the Prophet.

The second: The elevated status of the house of Fatimah (peace be upon her) in the Quran and the Sunnah.

The third: The bitter incidents that occurred to her after the death of her great father, the Messenger of Allah, may Allah's peace and blessings be upon him and his family.

The first: The infallibility of Fatimah (peace be upon her) in the words of the Prophet, may Allah's peace and blessings be upon him and his family:

Fatimah (peace be upon her) enjoyed a high status in the eyes of the Prophet, may Allah's peace and blessings be upon him and his family. He said about her:

"Fatimah is a part of me; whoever angers her has angered me."¹²

The anger of the Prophet, may Allah's peace and blessings be upon him and his family, is followed by severe consequences for the one who harms him. Anyone who harms him is destined for painful punishment, as Allah, the Exalted, says:

"And those who harm the Messenger of Allah will have a painful punishment."
[9:61]

In another narration, it is clarified that the anger and satisfaction of Fatimah (peace be upon her) result in the anger and satisfaction of Allah, the Exalted. It is said:

¹² Fath Al-Bari fi sharh Sahih Al-Bukhari: 7/84, and also Sahih Al-Bukhari: 4/210, Dar Al-Fikr, Beirut.

"O Fatimah, indeed, Allah becomes angry for your anger, and He is pleased with your satisfaction."¹³

This highlights the elevated status of Fatimah (peace be upon her), to the extent that her anger and satisfaction become a reflection of the anger and satisfaction of Allah, the Exalted. If this indicates anything, it certainly points to her infallibility. For Allah, the Exalted, being just and wise, becomes angry only with the disbeliever and the disobedient and is pleased only with the believer and the obedient.

In the light of this nobility, she became, in the words of the Prophet, peace and blessings be upon him and his family, the leader of the women of the worlds. He said:

"O Fatimah, are you not pleased to be the leader of the women of the worlds, the leader of the women of this nation, and the leader of the women of the believers?"¹⁴

Despite Fatimah (peace be upon her) being infallible, sinless, and not disobedient, she is not a prophet. There is no inherent connection between infallibility and prophethood. Mary, the Virgin, is an example of this, as she is sinless according to the noble text of the Holy Book, yet she is not a prophet:

When the angels said, 'O Mary, indeed Allah has chosen you and purified you and chosen you above the women of the worlds.' [3:42]

The reports about the purification of Mary after her selection are evidence of her purification from sins and compliance with the laws of her time.

As for her not being a prophet, it is a clear matter that does not require clarification. For she is the daughter of the Seal of the Prophets, the lady of the women of the worlds; like Mary the Virgin, immaculate but not a prophet.

Let us confine ourselves to briefly stating the virtues of Zahra, peace be upon her, as an in-depth exploration requires a separate classification.

The second: The elevated status of the house of Fatimah (peace be upon her) in the Quran and the Sunnah:

Allah, may He be glorified, revealed: ***'In houses which Allah has permitted to be raised and His name be mentioned therein.'* [24:36]** upon the heart of the Master of the Messengers, and he, may Allah bless him and his family, was in the noble mosque. A man stood up and asked, 'O Messenger of Allah, which houses are these?' He replied, 'The houses of the prophets.' Abu Bakr stood up and asked, 'O Messenger of Allah, is this house one of them?' pointing to the house of Ali and Fatimah, may peace be upon them. He said, 'Yes, among the most excellent of them.'¹⁵

¹³ Mustadrak Al-Hakim: 3/154; Majma' Al-Zawa'id: 9/203. Al-Hakim classified it as authentic according to the conditions of Bukhari and Muslim, but they did not include it. Nonetheless, this hadith is considered authentic by both Bukhari and Muslim and is agreed upon.

¹⁴ Mustadrak Al-Hakim: 3/156.

¹⁵ Al-Durr al-Manthur: 6/203, Tafsir Surah al-Nur; Ruḥ al-Ma'ānī: 18/174.

When Allah said, 'In houses,' it is a preposition for what was mentioned before, as in His saying, **'The example of His light is like a niche in which there is a lamp.'** [24:35] The light that the verse highlighted, with its attributes, is the source of radiance in these houses that Allah has permitted to be raised. How could they not have a special rank and honor?

Al-Suyuti said: Al-Tirmidhi narrated and authenticated it, and Ibn Jarir, Ibn al-Mundhir, al-Hakim, and Ibn Mardawayh, and al-Bayhaqi in his Sunan, reported from various chains from Umm Salamah, may Allah be pleased with her, who said: 'In my house, the verse was revealed: **'Allah intends only to keep away from you the impurity [of sin], O people of the [Prophet's] household, and to purify you with [extensive] purification.'** [33:33], and in the house were Fatimah, Ali, Hasan, and Husayn, peace be upon them. So the Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless him and his family, covered them with a cloak that was on him and said, 'These are my family, so keep away impurity from them and purify them extensively.'

He also said: Ibn Abi Shaybah, Ahmad, Al-Tirmidhi, Ibn Jarir, Ibn al-Mundhir, Al-Tabarani, Al-Hakim, and Ibn Mardawayh narrated from Anas that the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings be upon him and his family) used to pass by the door of Fatimah (peace be upon her) when he went out for the Fajr prayer and would say, "Prayer, O people of the household, prayer. **Indeed, Allah intends only to remove from you the impurity, O people of the household, and to purify you with thorough purification.**"¹⁶

If this is the status and honor of the house in the sight of Allah, then violating and disrespecting it constitutes one of the greatest sins and ugliest offenses.

However, the Prophet's injunction regarding the respect for this house and its members has not been heeded. This led to distressing incidents that were narrated by a group of historians and narrators. We will present their statements in chronological order.

Historians can be divided into two groups:

A group that talks about attempts of intimidation, covert threats, and malicious intentions. Another group that provided more detailed accounts of these attempts and the subsequent events.

We have dedicated the first chapter to mention the names of the first group and their statements. The second chapter is dedicated to the names of the second group and their statements.

Attempts of intimidation in the words of historians:

1. Ibn Abi Shaybah and his Musannaf.
2. Al-Baladhuri and his Kitab al-Ansab.
3. Ibn Qutaybah and his al-Imamah wal Siyasah.
4. Al-Tabari and his Tareekh.
5. Ibn Abd Rabbah and his al-'Iqd al-Fareed.
6. Ibn Abd al-Barr and his al-Isti'ab.

¹⁶ Al-Durr al-Manthur: 6/604-605, Dar al-Fikr, Beirut; Al-Musannaf: 7/527.

7. Ibn Abi al-Hadid and his Sharh Nahj al-Balagha.
8. Abu al-Fida and his al-Mukhtasar fi Tareekh al-Bashar.
9. Al-Nuwayri and his Nihayat al-Irb fi funun al-Adab.
10. Al-Suyuti and his Musnad Fatima.
11. Al-Muttaqi al-Hindi and his Kanz al-'Ummaal.
12. Al-Dahlawi and his Izalat al-Khifa'.
13. Muhammad Hafez Ibrahim and his al-Qasida al-'Umariyyah.
14. Umar Rida Kehala and his A'laam al-Nisa'.

1) Attempts of intimidation in the words of historians

Ibn Abi Shaybah and his Musannaf

Abdullah bin Muhammad bin Abi Shaybah al-Kufi al-'Abasi (who passed away in the year 235) narrated in his book "Al-Musannaf," in the second volume, in the chapter titled "What Came Regarding the Caliphate of Abu Bakr and His Biography during the Apostasy." He narrated and said:

Muhammad bin Bishr informed us, Ubaidullah bin Umar informed us, Zaid bin Aslam informed us from his father Aslam, that when Abu Bakr was pledged allegiance to after the Messenger of Allah (saw), Ali and Zubair used to enter upon Fatimah, the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (saw). They would consult her and reconsider their matter. When Umar bin al-Khattab learned of this, he went out until he entered upon Fatimah and said: "O daughter of the Messenger of Allah (saw)! By Allah, there is no one dearer to us than your father, and no one dearer to us after your father than you. But, I swear by Allah, that will not prevent me, if these people gather at your door, from commanding them (my men) to burn the house over them." He said, "So when Umar went out, they (Ali and Zubair) came to her, and she said, 'Do you know that Umar has come to me and has sworn by Allah that if you return, he will burn the house over you? I swear by Allah, he will carry out what he has sworn to. So, go away having reconsidered your matter, and do not come back to me.'" So, they left without returning to her until they pledged allegiance to Abu Bakr."¹⁷

The authenticity of this narration is dependent on the credibility of the author and its narrators. Let us begin by studying their biographies.

As for Ibn Abi Shaybah, what Dhahabi mentioned in "Mizan al-I'tidal" is sufficient for his credibility, where he said:

"Abdullah bin Muhammad bin Abi Shaybah, the great Hafiz, the Hujjah, Abu Bakr. Ahmad bin Hanbal, Al-Bukhari, Abu Al-Qasim Al-Baghawi, and the people narrated from him and considered him trustworthy." Then he said: "Abu Bakr 'meant by it Abu Shaybah,' one of

¹⁷ Al-Musannaf: 8/572, Dar al-Fikr, Beirut, Edited and Annotated by Saeed Muhammad al-Laham.

those who jumped over the bridge, and he is at the highest level of trust. He died in the first year of 235."¹⁸

This is the status of the author. As for the status of the narrators, let us start with the first one:

Muhammad bin Bishr. He is known by Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani, who said: Muhammad bin Bishr bin al-Farafisa bin al-Mukhtar al-Hafiz al-Abdi, Abu Abdullah al-Kufi. Ibn Ma'in attested to his reliability, and Abu Dawood recognized him as more memorizing than anyone in Kufa. Al-Bukhari and Ibn Hibban in al-Thuqat mentioned: he died in the year 203. Then the authentication by others was transmitted about him.¹⁹

Ubaidullah bin Umar. He is known by Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani, who said: Ubaidullah bin Umar bin Hafs bin Asim bin Umar bin al-Khattab al-Adawi, al-Umari, al-Madani, Abu Uthman, one of the seven jurists. He passed away in the year 147 AH. Amr bin Ali reported that Yahya bin Saeed mentioned to him the statement of Ibn Mahdi: "Malik confirmed more from Nafi' than Ubaidullah." He got angry and said: Abu Hatim reported from Ahmad, "Ubaidullah confirmed them, memorized them, and narrated the most." Ibn Ma'in said: Ubaidullah is trustworthy. Al-Nasai said: Trustworthy, confirmed. Abu Zur'ah and Abu Hatim said: Trustworthy. And other similar words of praise.²⁰

Zaid ibn Aslam al-Adawi. He is known by Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani, who said: Zaid ibn Aslam al-Adawi, Abu Usama, and it is also said: Abu Abdullah al-Madani, the jurist, the freedman of Umar. Ahmad, Abu Zur'ah, Abu Hatim, Muhammad ibn Saad, and Ibn Khirash all considered him trustworthy. Yaqub ibn Shaybah said: Trustworthy, knowledgeable in jurisprudence and science, and he was well-versed in the interpretation of the Quran. He died in the year 136.²¹

Aslam al-Adawi. Aslam al-Adawi, the freedman of Abu Khaled, and it is also said Abu Zaid, though he was Ethiopian. It is said he was from the captives of Ain al-Tamar. He lived during the time of the Prophet and narrated from Abu Bakr, his master Umar, Uthman, Ibn Umar, Muadh ibn Jabal, Abu Ubaydah, and Hafsah. Al-Ajli said: From Madinah, trustworthy, among the prominent tabi'een. Abu Zur'ah said: Trustworthy. Abu Ubaid said: He passed away in the year eighty. Others said: He was one hundred and fourteen years old.²²

We have sufficed in presenting the biographies of the narrators with what Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani transmitted, and we have not mentioned what others have said about them for the sake of brevity.

From this research, it is evident that the narration is authentic, and the chain of transmission is highly reliable.

¹⁸ Mizan al-I'tidal: 2/490, Number 4549.

¹⁹ Tahdhib al-Tahdhib: 9/73, Biography Number 90.

²⁰ Tahdhib al-Tahdhib: 7/38-40, Biography Number 71

²¹ Tahdhib al-Tahdhib: 3/395-396, Biography number 728.

²² Tahdhib al-Tahdhib: 1/266, Biography number 501.

Al-Baladhuri and his al-Ansab

Ahmad ibn Yahya ibn Jaber al-Baghdadi, the eminent writer, the author of the well-known "Tarikh", recounted the bitter incident in his book and said: In a detailed discussion about the Saqifah matter:

When people pledged allegiance to Abu Bakr, Ali and al-Zubair excused themselves, until he said: Abu Bakr sent for Ali seeking allegiance, but he did not pledge allegiance. Then Umar came with a burning torch, and Fatimah received him at the door. Fatimah said, "O son of Khattab, do you intend to burn my door upon me?" He replied, "Yes, because this act will strengthen the faith brought to us by your father."²³

The authentication of the narration is contingent upon the reliability of the author and those who narrated from him. We say: As for the author, al-Dhahabi described him in his book "Tadhkirat al-Huffaz" quoting al-Hakim as saying: He was unique in his era in memorization, and our sheikhs, including Abu Ali al-Hafiz, used to attend his preaching sessions, rejoicing in what he mentioned on the heads of the authorities in the chains of transmission. I have never seen them wink at him regarding the chain of transmission to the end of what he mentioned.²⁴

He also said in "Siyar A'lam al-Nubala": The scholar, the literary figure, the compiler, Abu Bakr, Ahmad ibn Yahya ibn Jaber al-Baghdadi, al-Baladhuri, the writer, the author of "al-Tarikh al-Kabir."²⁵ Ibn Kathir also said in the book "Al-Bidaya wal-Nihaya," quoting Ibn Asakir: He was a literary figure, and books of virtues appeared to him.²⁶

This is the state of the author. As for the status of the narrators whose names are mentioned in the chain, here is their biography:

Al-Madaini. He is Ali ibn Muhammad Abu al-Hasan al-Madaini al-Akhbari, the author of compilations. Al-Zubair ibn Bakkar, Ahmad ibn Zuhair, Al-Harith ibn Abi Usama narrated from him. Al-Dhahabi mentioned that Yahya said: Al-Madaini is trustworthy, trustworthy, trustworthy. He died in the year four or five and two hundred.²⁷

Muslamah ibn Muharib. Muslamah ibn Muharib al-Ziyadi from his father, mentioned by Al-Bukhari in his Tarikh²⁸ The scholars have said that the silence of Abu Zur'ah or Abu Hatim or Al-Bukhari about the narrator is an endorsement for him. Al-Hafiz Ibn Hajar followed this rule in "Ta'jil al-Manfa'ah," and you find him saying in many places: Al-Bukhari mentioned him without mentioning any criticism.²⁹

Sulaiman ibn Tarkhan. Sulaiman ibn Tarkhan al-Taymi, loyal, narrated from Anas ibn Malik, Tawus, and others. Al-Rabi ibn Yahya reported from Saeed: I have not seen anyone more truthful than Sulaiman al-Taymi. Abdullah bin Ahmad reported from his father:

²³ Ansab al-Ashraf: 1/586, published by Dar al-Ma'arif, Cairo.

²⁴ Tadhkirat al-Huffaz: 3/892, number 860.

²⁵ Siyar A'lam al-Nubala: 13/162, number 96.

²⁶ Al-Bidaya wal-Nihaya: 11/69, events of the year 279.

²⁷ Mizan al-I'tidal: 3/153, Biography Number 5921.

²⁸ Al-Tarikh al-Kabir: 7/387, Biography Number 1685.

²⁹ Refer to Qawa'id fi ulum al-Hadith: 385, 403, and Ta'jil al-Manfa'ah: 219, 223, 225, 254.

Trustworthy. Ibn Ma'in and Al-Nasai said: Trustworthy. Al-Ajli said: He is a tabi'i, trustworthy, and among the best of the people of Basra. Among other affirmations, he passed away in the year 97.³⁰

Ibn Awn. Awn bin Artaban Al-Muzani Al-Basri, he saw Anas bin Malik (died in the year 151). Al-Nasai said in Al-Kuna: Trustworthy, reliable. In another place, he said: Trustworthy, established. Ibn Hibban said in Al-Thiqaat: He was among the leaders of his time, devoted and virtuous, pious, ascetic, firm in adherence to the Sunnah, and stern against the people of innovation.³¹

Up to this point, the authenticity of the chain is clear, and the narration is authentic. All its narrators are trustworthy, and that is sufficient as a judgment.

These two texts narrated by trustworthy individuals express negative intentions from the two caliphs. In the second part, it will be clarified that they embodied their intentions towards the family of the Prophet (peace be upon them).

Ibn Qutaybah and his al-Imamah wal Siyasah

The renowned historian Abdullah ibn Muslim ibn Qutaibah al-Dinawari (213-276) was a pioneer in literature and history. He authored numerous books, including "Ta'weel Mukhtalif al-Hadith" and "Adab al-Katib," among others.³²

In his well-known book "al-Imamah wal Siyasah," also known as "Tarikh al-Khulafah," he mentioned:

Abu Bakr investigated a group that had reneged from his allegiance and were with Ali, may Allah honor his face. Umar sent to them, and when they came, he called them while they were at Ali's house. They refused to come out, so he called for firewood, declaring, "By the One in whose hand is Umar's soul, you will come out, or I will burn the house with everyone inside." They informed him, "O Abu Hafs, Fatimah is inside." He replied, "So what?"

Until he said:

Then Umar stood up and walked with a group until they reached Fatimah's house. They knocked on the door, and when she heard their voices, she called out loudly, "O father, O Messenger of Allah, what have we encountered after you from Ibn al-Khattab and Ibn Abi Quhafah?" When the people heard her voice and her weeping, they turned away weeping. Their hearts almost cracked, and their livers almost burst. Umar remained with a group, and they brought out Ali and took him to Abu Bakr. They said to him, "Give allegiance." He replied, "If I do not, what will you do?" They said, "By Allah, whom there is no god but He, we will strike your neck."³³

³⁰ Tahdhib al-Tahdhib: 4/201-202, Biography number 341.

³¹ Tahdhib al-Tahdhib: 5/346-348, Biography number 600.

³² Al-A'laam: 4/137.

³³ Al-Imamah wal Siyasah: 12th and 13th editions, Al-Maktaba Al-Tijariya Al-Kubra, Egypt.

Indeed, whoever reads the book "al-Imamah wal Siyasah" sees it as the counterpart to the other historical books of our historians, such as Baladhuri, Tabari, and others. Ibn Abi al-Hadid attributed this book to him in his commentary on Nahj al-Balagha, and he quoted many statements from it that may not be found in the printed version in Egypt. This, if anything, indicates tampering with the book. Elias Sarkis also attributed it to him in his Mu'jam.³⁴

Yes, the author of Al-A'laam mentioned that scholars had different opinions about attributing it to him, meaning that some hesitated to attribute it to him but did not outright deny it.

In any case, it is a historical book, similar to other historical works.

Al-Tabari and his Tareekh

Muhammad ibn Jarir al-Tabari (224-310 AH), the author of well-known histories and exegeses among scholars, has been cited by all who came after him. He recounted the sorrowful story of the Saqifah and said:

*Ibn Humayd informed us, saying: Jarir narrated to us from Mugheerah, from Ziyad ibn Kulayb, who said: Umar ibn al-Khattab came to Ali's house, where Talha, Zubair, and men from the Muhajireen were present. Umar said, "By Allah, I will set your house on fire unless you come out for allegiance." So, Zubair came out, holding a sword, but he stumbled, and the sword fell from his hand. They rushed towards him and seized him.*³⁵

This excerpt from Islamic history indicates that the pledging allegiance to the caliph was coerced, and those who refused faced various threats, including the burning and destruction of their homes. Since al-Tabari transmitted this account with a chain of narration, we should study its chain, just as we have studied what Ibn Abi Shaybah and al-Baladhuri narrated, to strengthen and consolidate the evidence, leaving no room for doubt or skepticism.

Regarding al-Tabari, his scholarship and reliability are unquestionable. Al-Dhahabi described him by saying: "The esteemed imam, the exegete, the author of outstanding compilations, trustworthy, and truthful."³⁶

As for the study of the narrators in the chain, we say:

Ibn Humayd. He is Muhammad ibn Humayd Al-Hafiz, Abu Abdullah Al-Razi. He narrated from several individuals, including Ya'qub ibn Abdullah Al-Qumi, Ibrahim ibn Al-Mukhtar, and Jarir ibn Abdul-Hameed. Abu Dawood, Al-Tirmidhi, Ibn Majah, Ahmad ibn Hanbal, and Yahya ibn Ma'een narrated from him, among others. Abdullah ibn Ahmad

³⁴ Mu'jam al-Matub'at al-'Arabiyyah, 1/212.

³⁵ Tareekh of al-Tabari: 2/443, Beirut edition.

³⁶ Tahdhib al-Tahdhib: 9/128-131, Biography number 180.

reported from his father: Knowledge will continue in Ray as long as Muhammad ibn Humayd is alive. Muhammad ibn Yahya Al-Zuhri was asked about Muhammad ibn Humayd, and he said: "Don't you see me here? I narrate from him." Ibn Khaythama said: Ibn Ma'een asked him, and he said: "Trustworthy, no issue with him, a Razi, intelligent." Abu Al-Abbas ibn Saeed said: I heard Jafar ibn Abi Uthman Al-Tayalisi saying: Ibn Humayd is trustworthy; Yahya narrated from him. He died in the year 248 H.³⁷ Some criticized him, but the statement of the moderate is given precedence over the one who criticizes.

Jarir ibn Abdul-Hameed. Jarir ibn Abdul-Hameed ibn Qart Al-Dhabi, Abu Abdullah Al-Razi, the judge, was born in a village near Isfahan. He grew up in Kufa and resided in Ray. Ishaq ibn Rahwayh, the two sons of Abu Shaybah, Ali ibn Al-Madeeni, Yahya ibn Ma'een, and a group of scholars narrated from him. He was considered trustworthy, and people would travel to learn from him. Ibn Ammar Al-Musuli said: He was an authoritative figure, and his writings were authentic.³⁸

Al-Mugheerah ibn Miqsam Al-Dabi. Al-Mugheerah ibn Miqsam Al-Dabi, the Kufi, the jurist, was narrated from by Shu'bah, Al-Thawri, and a group of scholars. Abu Bakr ibn Ayyash said: I have not seen anyone more knowledgeable than Mughira, so I stuck with him. Al-Ajli said: Al-Mughira is trustworthy, a scholar of hadith.³⁹ Al-Nasai said: "Thiqa (trustworthy), he passed away in the year 136 AH." Ibn Hibban mentioned him in "Thiqaat".⁴⁰

Ziyad ibn Kulayb. Al-Dhahabi identified him by saying: "Abu Ma'shar al-Tamimi, Al-Kufi, narrating from Ibrahim and Al-Sha'bi, and narrated from him by Mughira. He died as a middle-aged man in the year 110 AH. Al-Nasai and others authenticated him."⁴¹ Ibn Hajar said: "Al-Ajli said: he was trustworthy in hadith, and Ibn Hibban said: he was among the precise preservers."⁴²

This concludes the study of the chain of narration reported by Al-Tabari, and we will limit our study of the chain to this extent because what we have mentioned is sufficient.

Ibn Abd Rabbah and his al-'Iqd al-Fareed

Shihab al-Din Ahmad, known as Ibn Abd Rabbah al-Andalusi (died in the year 463 H), composed a chapter on what transpired in the Saqifah of Bani Sa'ida. He said, under the title "Those Who Withheld Allegiance to Abu Bakr":

Ali, al-Abbas, al-Zubair, and Sa'd ibn Ubadah. As for Ali, al-Abbas, and al-Zubair, they sat in Fatima's house, where Umar ibn al-Khattab was sent by Abu Bakr to remove them from Fatima's house. He said to him, "If they refuse, then fight them." He approached with a

³⁷ Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib: 9/128-131, Biography Number 180.

³⁸ Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib: 2/75, Biography Number 116.

³⁹ Tahdhib Al-Tahdhib: 9/134, Biography Number 191.

⁴⁰ Tahdhib al-Tahdhib: 10/270, Number 482.

⁴¹ Mizan al-'Itdal: 2/92, Number 2959.

⁴² Tahdhib al-Tahdhib: 2/382, Number 698.

piece of burning wood intending to set the house on fire. Fatima confronted him and said, "O son of al-Khattab, have you come to burn our house?" He replied, "Yes, (either that) or you submit to what the Ummah has submitted to."⁴³

This text from the great historian is the strongest testimony that the caliph intended to burn the door and the house to force allegiance from Ali and those who adhered to his house, emphasizing the coercive nature of the allegiance.

Ibn Abd al-Barr and his Al-Isti'ab

Abu Amr Yusuf ibn Abd Allah ibn Muhammad ibn Abd al-Barr (368-463 H) narrated in his valuable book "Al-Isti'ab in the Knowledge of the Companions" with the following chain of narration:

We were informed by Muhammad ibn Ahmad, who was informed by Muhammad ibn Ayyub, who was informed by Ahmad ibn Amru al-Bazzaz, who was informed by Ahmad ibn Yahya, who was informed by Muhammad ibn Nasir, who was informed by Abdullah ibn Umar, from Zaid ibn Aslam, from his father, that when the pledge of allegiance was being given to Abu Bakr, Ali and al-Zubair used to enter upon Fatima, consult her, and reconsider their decisions. When Umar heard about this, he entered upon her and said, "O daughter of the Messenger of Allah, no one is dearer to us among creation than your father, and no one is dearer to us after him than you. I have been informed that these people visit you. If this reaches me again, I will do [so-and-so], I will do [so-and-so]." Then he left and they came to her. She said to them, "Umar has come to me and sworn that if you return, he will do [so-and-so]. By Allah, he will fulfill it [his oath]."⁴⁴

Abu Amru did not transmit the exact words of Umar ibn al-Khattab; rather, he contented himself with saying, "I will do [so-and-so], I will do [so-and-so]."

His words have been previously cited in the texts of others such as Ibn Abi Shaybah, al-Baladhuri, and al-Tabari. Perhaps circumstances did not allow him to explicitly state what he said.

Ibn Abi al-Hadid and his Sharh Nahj al-Balagha

Abdul Hameed ibn Hibat Allah Al-Madaini, the Mu'tazili (died in the year 655), narrated from the book Al-Saqifah by Ahmad ibn Abdul Aziz Al-Jawhari, saying:

"When Abu Bakr was pledged allegiance, Zubair and Miqdad disagreed and were with a group of people who pledged allegiance to Ali, and he was in the house of Fatimah. They consulted each other and reconsidered their matters. Umar came out until he entered upon Fatimah (peace be upon her) and said, 'O daughter of the Messenger of Allah, there is

⁴³ Al-Aqd al-Fareed: 4/87, edited by Khalil Sharaf al-Din.

⁴⁴ Al-Isti'ab: 3/975, edited by Ali Muhammad al-Bajawi, Cairo edition.

no one among the creation more beloved to us than your father. And there is no one more beloved to us after your father. But by Allah, that will not prevent me from, if these people gather around you, ordering the burning of the house upon them.' When Umar left, they came to her, and she said, 'Do you know that Umar came to me and swore by Allah that if you return, he will burn the house upon you? By Allah, they will proceed to what he swore to him!'"⁴⁵

Abu al-Fida and his al-Mukhtasar fi Akhbar al-Bashar

Ismail ibn Ali, known as Abu al-Fida (died in the year 732 AH), composed a book titled "Al-Mukhtasar fi Akhbar al-Bashar," in which he mentioned events that were close to what Ibn Abd Rabbah mentioned in "Al-Aqd al-Fareed." He stated:

"Then Abu Bakr sent Umar ibn al-Khattab to Ali and those with him to force them out of the house of Fatimah, may Allah be pleased with her. He said, 'If they refuse, fight them.' Umar approached with something flammable to set the house on fire. Fatimah, may Allah be pleased with her, met him and said, 'Where to, oh son of al-Khattab? Have you come to burn our house?' He replied, 'Yes, unless they submit to what the Ummah has submitted to.'"⁴⁶

Al-Nuwayri and his Nihayat al-Irb fi funun al-Adab

Ahmad ibn Abdulwahab al-Nuwayri (677–733 AH) is one of the eminent literary figures, with expertise in history as described in biographies. In his book "Nihayat al-Irb fi funun al-Adab," which Al-Zarkali described as containing valuable information, despite being from a later period, he presents significant accounts obtained from ancient historians whose writings have not reached us, such as Ibn al-Raqiq, Ibn al-Rashiq, Ibn Shaddad, and others. He said:⁴⁷

"Ibn Umar ibn Abdul Barr narrated with his chain from Zaid ibn Aslam, from his father, that when Abu Bakr was being pledged allegiance, Ali and Zubair used to consult Fatimah on their affairs. Umar heard about this and entered upon her, saying, 'O daughter of the Messenger of Allah, no one among the people is dearer to us than your father, and no one is dearer to us than you after him. I have heard that these individuals enter upon you, and if it reaches me again [that they enter upon you], I will surely do [so-and-so], and I will certainly do [so-and-so]!' Then he left, and they came to her. She said to them, 'Umar has come to me and sworn that if you return, he will surely do [so-and-so], and, by Allah, he will fulfill his oath.'"⁴⁸

⁴⁵ Sharh Nahj al-Balagha: 2/45, researched by Muhammad Abu al-Fadl Ibrahim.

⁴⁶ Al-Mukhtasar fi Tarikh al-Bashar: 1/156, Dar al-Ma'arif, Beirut.

⁴⁷ Al-I'lam: 1/165.

⁴⁸ Nihayat al-Irb fi Funun al-Adab: 19/40, Cairo, 1395 AH.

Al-Suyuti and his Musnad Fatima

Jalal al-Din Abdul Rahman al-Suyuti (848-911 AH), the eminent researcher and expert historian, mentions in his book "Musnad Fatima" the same narration as reported by historians from Zaid bin Aslam, who narrated from his father Aslam:

"When Abu Bakr was pledged allegiance after the Messenger of Allah (saw), Ali and Zubair would enter upon Fatima, the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (saw). They would consult her and seek her advice, and then they would proceed with their decision. When Umar ibn al-Khattab learned of this, he went out until he entered upon Fatima. He said, 'O daughter of the Messenger of Allah, by Allah, among all the people, none is dearer to me than your father, and after your father, none is dearer to us than you. But by Allah, there is nothing preventing me from commanding them (my men) to set the door on fire if they gather at your house.' When Umar came out to them, they came forward. She said, 'You know that Umar has come to me, swearing by Allah that if you do not return, he will order the setting of fire to the door upon you. By Allah, he will carry out what he has sworn.'"⁴⁹

Al-Muttaqi al-Hindi and his Kanz al-'Ummaal

Ali ibn Hissam al-Din, known as Al-Muttaqi al-Hindi (died in 975), transmitted in his valuable book "Kanz al-'Ummaal" what happened at the house of Fatimah al-Zahraa, peace be upon her, according to what is mentioned in the book "Al-Musannaf" by Ibn Abi Shaybah. He said:

From Aslam: When Abu Bakr was pledged allegiance after the Messenger of Allah (saw), Ali and Al-Zubair used to enter upon Fatimah, peace be upon her, the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (saw). They would consult her and seek her opinion, and when Umar ibn al-Khattab learned about this, he went out until he entered upon Fatimah, peace be upon her, and said, "O daughter of the Messenger of Allah, there is no one among the creation more beloved to me than your father, and there is no one more beloved to us after your father than you. But, I swear by Allah, that will not prevent me, if these people gather at your door, from commanding them (my men) to burn the door over them." And he continued speaking until the end of what was mentioned.⁵⁰

Al-Dawhlawi and his Izalat al-Khifa'

Waliullah ibn Mawlawi Abd al-Rahim al-Umari, Al-Dahlawi, Al-Hindi, Al-Hanafi (1114-1176 AH), conveyed in his book "Izalat al-Khifa'" what happened at the Saqifah of Banu Sa'ida, and he said:

⁴⁹ Musnad Fatima: Al-Suyuti: 36, published by the Cultural Books Foundation, Beirut.

⁵⁰ Kanz al-Ummal: 5/651, number 14138.

Narrated by Aslam with a chain of transmission that is authentic according to the conditions of the two sheikhs, and he said: When Abu Bakr was pledged allegiance after the Messenger of Allah (saw), Ali and Al-Zubair used to enter upon Fatimah, the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (saw). They would consult her and reconsider their decisions. When Umar ibn al-Khattab learned about this, he went out until he entered upon Fatimah and said, "O daughter of the Messenger of Allah, by Allah, there is no one among the creation more beloved to us than your father, and there is no one more beloved to us after your father than you. But, I swear by Allah, that will not prevent me, if these people gather at your door, from commanding them (my men) to burn the house over them."⁵¹ And he mentioned something similar to that in his other book "Qurrat al-Aynayn".⁵²

Muhammad Hafez Ibrahim and his al-Qasida al-'Umariyyah

Muhammad Hafez bin Ibrahim Fahmy Al-Mohandes, known as Hafez Ibrahim (1287-1351 AH), the renowned nationalist poet of Egypt. His collection of poetry was published in two volumes, and he had an ode that celebrated by the literati of Egypt. In it, he says:

***And a statement to Ali made by Umar,
noble to its hearer and significant to its speaker***

***I will burn your house and leave no one in it if you do not pledge allegiance,
even if the daughter of the chosen Prophet is inside***

***No one other than Abu Hafs (Umar) dared to utter such a statement
in the face of the knight of Adnan and its defender.⁵³***

What's astonishing is that the Nile's poet considers sins as saviors, and counts evils as virtues, and this is only because love blinds and deafens. This means that the daughter of Mustafa had no sanctity or honor in Umar's eyes when he prepared to burn the house and its inhabitants to make Abu Bakr the caliph of Muslims.

Al-Aminy commented after quoting the three verses, and this is his text:

What can I say after the Egyptian nation celebrated in a university event in early 1918, singing this ode that includes the mentioned verses, published by newspapers worldwide? Men of Egypt, like Ahmed Amin, Ahmed El-Zein, Ibrahim Al-Biari, Ali Jaram, Ali

⁵¹ Izalat al-Khifa': 2/178.

⁵² Qurrat al-'Aynayn: 78.

⁵³ Hafez Ibrahim's Diwan: 1/82

Amin, Khalil Matran, Mustafa El-Demyati, and others, take care of spreading his poetry collection, appreciating the poet's feelings, stirring emotions in this crisis, in this difficult day, and tarnishing the unity of Muslims with these sectarian tones, disrupting peace and harmony at the Islamic University. They think they are doing good.

Until he said: And you see them exaggerating in praising the poet and this poem as if he came to the nation with a comprehensive knowledge or a new righteous opinion, or as if he came with a virtue for Umar that delights the nation and its sacred prophet. Rather, he brings tidings, or rather, he brings two tidings to the greatest prophet, that his blessed daughter's sanctity had no sacredness and dignity in the eyes of those who utter such words, and her dwelling in the purified home of the family of the Prophet did not protect them from him and from the burning of the house upon them. So, he rejoices in choosing this pledge of allegiance that resulted in terrorism, and passed with stigmas.⁵⁴

Umar Rida Kehala and his A'laam al-Nisa'

Umar Rida, as a contemporary writer, became famous for his book "A'laam al-Nisa'" in which he writes the biography of the life of the Prophet's daughter Fatima al-Zahraa - peace be upon her. In his biography, he mentioned the following:

Abu Bakr checked on a group that had deviated from his (Abu Bakr's) allegiance to Ali ibn Abi Talib, such as Abbas, al-Zubair, and Sa'd ibn Ubadah. They gathered in the house of Fatima. Abu Bakr sent Umar ibn al-Khattab to them. Umar came to them and called them while they were in Fatima's house. They refused to come out, so he called for firewood and said, "By the One in whose hand is Umar's soul, you will come out, or I will burn it with everyone inside." They told him, "O Abu Hafs, there is Fatima inside." He said, "So what?" Then Fatima stood at her door and said, "I have no covenant with a people who attended a worse gathering than yours, leaving the Messenger of Allah (saw) unburied in front of us, and you settled your matter among yourselves without consulting us or giving us our rights."⁵⁵

Up to this point, we have covered what is mentioned in the books of the Sunnis regarding those who alluded to the negative intentions of the caliph concerning the Prophet's daughter and her household, although most of these sources did not delve into the details or mention the bitter incidents that followed. However, there are individuals who have shown courage in revealing the truth, pointing out the painful events that befell the Hashemite house.

Now, we refer to their names in historical sequence:

The exposure of the House of Fatima (peace be upon her) in the words of historians:

15. Abu Ubayd and his Kitab al-Amwal.

⁵⁴ Al-Ghadir: 7/86-87.

⁵⁵ A'laam al-Nisa', 4/114.

16. Ibn Sa'd and his *Tabaqat al-Kubra*.
17. Al-Nidham and his *Kitab al-Wafi bil Wafiyyat*.
18. Al-Mubarrad and his *Kitab al-Kamil*.
19. Al-Mas'udi and his *Muruj al-Dhahab*.
20. Ibn Abi Darim and his *Mizan al-I'tidal*.
21. Al-Tabarani and his *Mu'jam al-Kabir*.
22. Ibn Abd Rabbah and his *al-'Iqd al-Fareed*.
23. Ibn Asakir and his *Mukhtasar Tarikh Dimashq*.
24. Ibn Abi al-Hadid and his *Sharh Nahj al-Balagha*.
25. Al-Juwayni and his *Kitab Fara'id al-Simtayn*.
26. Al-Dhahabi and his *Tarikh al-Islam*.
27. Nur al-Din al-Haythami and his *Majma' al-Zawa'id*.
28. Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani and his *Lisaan al-Mizan*.
29. Al-Muttaqi al-Hindi and his *Kanz al-'Ummaal*.
30. Abdul Fattah Abdul Maqsum and *Kitab al-Imam Ali*.

2) The exposure of the House of Fatima (peace be upon her) in the words of historians

Abu Ubayd and his Kitab al-Amwal

Abu Ubayd Qasim ibn Salam (died in 224) was one of the prominent jurists of the third century. He became well-known for his valuable book "*Al-Amwal*," which was printed multiple times. He unveiled the truth and highlighted the hardships faced by the household of Fatimah. It is reported that he narrated the following from Abdur Rahman ibn Awf:

I entered upon Abu Bakr while he was in his illness in which he died, so I greeted him and said, 'I do not see any ailment in you, praise be to Allah, and do not grieve for this world. By Allah, we do not attribute to you but goodness and righteousness.' He said, "I do not grieve for anything except for three things I have done. I wish I had not done them. And three things I did not do, and I wish I had done them. And three things I wish I had asked the Messenger of Allah (saw) about. As for what I have done and wish I had not done, I wish I had not done such-and-such and such-and-such. -regarding this specific incident, Abu Ubayd mentioned, "I do not want to mention it.- And I wish that on the day of the Saqifah of Banu Sa'ida, I had thrown the matter upon the neck of one of the two men (given them the

caliphate), either Umar or Abu Ubaidah, so one of them could be the leader, and I the minister. And I wish that when I went with Khalid to confront the people of apostasy, I had remained in Dhi al-Qissah. If the Muslims had been victorious, they would have been victorious, and if not, I would have been prepared for a meeting or delay."⁵⁶

Despite the author of Al-Amwal not explicitly stating the caliph's full statement and disapproving of mentioning it, others presented the same text that the caliph had stated on the day he was bedridden. This aligns with the statements of others in this regard.

Ibn Sa'd and his Tabaqat al-Kubra

Muhammad ibn Sa'd (died in the year 229 AH) mentions in his biography of Abu Bakr what is the following text:

*He said: Abdullah ibn al-Zubair informed us, Isma'il ibn 'Amr narrated to us, saying: Abu Bakr came to Fatimah when she was ill, so he sought permission. Ali said: Abu Bakr is at the door, do you give him permission to come in? She said: Is that what you prefer? He said: Yes. So, she allowed him in, and he apologized to her and spoke to her, and she was pleased with him.*⁵⁷

Al-Nidham and his al-Wafi bil Wafiyyat

Salah al-Din Khalil ibn Aybik al-Safadi authored a book called "Al-Wafi bil-Wafiyyat," supplementing Ibn Khallikan's book "Wifayyat al-A'yan." In it, he wrote a biography of the Mu'tazili scholar Ibrahim ibn Sayyar al-Basri (160-231 AH). He said: The Mu'tazilites said that he (al-Nidham) was given this title due to the excellence of his speech in both prose and verse. He was the nephew of Abu Huthayl al-Alaf, the leader of the Mu'tazilites, and was extremely intelligent. He conveyed his opinions, and it was said:

*"On the day of allegiance, Umar struck the abdomen of Fatimah until she miscarried Al-Muhsin from her belly."*⁵⁸

Al-Mubarrad and his al-Kamil

Mohammed ibn Yazid ibn Abdul-Akbar al-Baghdadi (210-285 AH), one of the literati and writers, and the author of delightful works, transmitted in the book "Al-Kamil" what was narrated by Abdul Rahman ibn 'Awf when he visited Abu Bakr during his illness, in which he died. He said:

⁵⁶ Al-Amwal, pages 193-194, Al-Azhar Colleges Library.

⁵⁷ Al-Tabaqat: 8/27, published by Dar Sader.

⁵⁸ Al-Wafi bil-Wafiyyat: 6/17; and Al-Milal wal-Nihal by al-Shahrastani: 1/57, published by Dar al-Ma'arif. Also, note in the biography of Al-Nidham in our book "Buhuth fil Milal wal Nihal": 3/248-255.

*"I entered upon Abu Bakr to visit him during his illness in which he died. I greeted him and asked: How are you? He sat up straight and said: Abu Bakr said, 'I do not grieve except for three things that I did and wish I had not done, and three things that I did not do and wish I had done, and three things I wish I had asked the Messenger of Allah about. As for the three things I did and wish I had not done: I regret uncovering Fatimah's house even if they had locked it with the intention of fighting. I wish I had thrown the matter to one of the two men at the Saqifah of Bani Sa'ida: either Umar or Abu 'Ubaidah, so one became the Emir and I the Minister. I wish that I had not burned al-Fuja'ah and that I would have killed him with iron (a sword) or let him go. As for the three things I did not do and wish I had done: ..."*⁵⁹

Al-Mas'udi and his Muruj al-Dhahab

Abu al-Hasan Ali ibn al-Husayn ibn Ali al-Mas'udi (died in the year 346 AH), one of the talented historians who played a significant role in recording the history of Islam. He mentioned in his famous work "Muruj al-Dhahab" when discussing Abu Bakr, his lineage, and highlighting some of his reports and biography. He said:

*"In his own words, when he was on his deathbed, he said: I regret three things I did and wish I had not done, and three things I left undone and wish I had done. As for the three things I did and regret, I wish I had not searched the house of Fatimah – and he mentioned a lot in this regard. I wish that I had not burned al-Fuja'ah and released him as a wild animal or killed him outright. I wish that on the day of the Saqifah of Bani Sa'ida, I had thrown the matter around the neck of one of the two men, making him a leader and I the minister. As for the three things I left undone and wish I had done... and so on."*⁶⁰

Ibn Abi Darim and his Mizan al-I'tidal

Ahmad ibn Muhammad, known as Ibn Abi Darim, the Kufan hadith scholar (died in the year 357 AH) is recognized by Al-Dhahabi, who describes him as possessing memorization and knowledge. Al-Hakim also narrates from him.⁶¹

In his book Mizan al-I'tidal, he also states: "He was upright throughout his life, but in the last days, he was often subjected to insults and accusations. A man would read to him: Umar beat Fatimah until she miscarried Muhsin."⁶²

⁵⁹ Sharh Nahj al-Balagha: 2/45-47, and refer to Al-Kamil: 1/11, edited by Dr. Muhammad Ahmed al-Dalli, Al-Risalah Foundation, Beirut. The researcher noted that the text was found in Al-Kamil, where he transmitted part of it regarding this text. However, the trustworthy hand in heritage distorted the rest and did not mention the narration in its entirety, as Ibn Abi al-Hadid conveyed from al-Jawhari from Al-Kamil of Al-Mubarrad.

Yes, the researcher in the footnote on the page referred to what was narrated by the author of Al-'Iqd Al-Fareed.

⁶⁰ Muruj al-Dhahab, 2/301, Dar al-Andalus, Beirut.

⁶¹ Siyar A'lam al-Nubala, 15/578, Biography number 349.

⁶² Mizan al-I'tidal, 1/139, Biography number 552.

Al-Tabarani and his Mu'jam al-Kabir

Abu al-Qasim Sulaiman ibn Ahmad al-Tabarani (260-360 AH), the author of "Al-Mu'jam al-Kabir," as recognized by al-Dhahabi in his Mizan, and he says: "Hafiz, Thabit."⁶³

He reported in a chapter he titled "What Abu Bakr Narrated from the Messenger of Allah," and in that chapter came the hadith of Abd al-Rahman ibn Awf narrating what Abu Bakr said to him during his illness in which he passed away. Abu Bakr said to him:

"I don't regret anything except for three things I regret doing and wish I had not done, and three things I regret not doing and wish I had done, and three things I wish I had asked the Messenger of Allah (saw) about. As for the three things I regret doing and wish I had not done, I wish I had not unveiled Fatima's house, and instead left it alone even if they locked it for war (fighting). I wish I had thrown the matter into the neck of one of the two men, either Abu Ubaydah or Umar, on the day of the Saqifah of Bani Sa'ida, so one was the leader, and I was the minister... and so on."⁶⁴

Ibn Abd Rabbah and his al-'Iqd al-Fareed

Ibn Abd Rabbah's discourse regarding the dialogue between Fatimah and Umar ibn al-Khattab progresses without alluding to the bitter incidents that occurred afterward. However, he explicitly stated in another context regarding the exposure of the house when narrating the conversation of Abdul Rahman ibn 'Awf during his visit to Abu Bakr in his illness. He said, "Under the title of the succession to Abu Bakr of Umar":

Indeed, I do not grieve about anything in this world except for three things that I did, and I wish I had left them, and three things that I left, and I wish I had done them, and three things I wish I had asked the Messenger of Allah (saw) about." As for the three things that I did and wish I had left them, I wish I had not opened Fatimah's house for anything, even if they closed it for war, etc.⁶⁵

Ibn Asakir and his Mukhtasar Tarikh Dimashq

Ali ibn Hasan, known as Ibn Asakir (died in the year 571 AH), authored a book on the history of Damascus, printed in eighty volumes. Muhammad ibn Makram, also known as Abu Manzur (620–711 AH), summarized it. In the biography of Abu Bakr, it is mentioned that Abu Bakr was visited during his illness before his death. Abu Bakr said:

"I do not grieve over anything in this world except for three things that I did and wish I had not done, and three things that I refrained from and wish I had done, and three things I wish I had asked the Messenger of Allah (saw) about. As for the things I wish I had refrained

⁶³ Mizan al-I'tidal: 2/195, translation number 3423.

⁶⁴ Al-Mu'jam al-Kabir: 1/62, entry number 43.

⁶⁵ Al-'Iqd al-Farid: 4/93, under the title of the succession to Abu Bakr of Umar.

from: the day of the Saqifah of Banu Sa'ida. I wish I had entrusted this matter to one of these two men - meaning Umar and Abu Ubaidah - so that one of them would be the leader while I served as the minister. I wish I had not revealed anything about Fatima's house, even though they had closed it for conflict."⁶⁶

Ibn Abi al-Hadid and his book Sharh Nahj al-Balaghah

Abd al-Hamid ibn Hibat Allah al-Mada'ini al-Mu'tazili (died in the year 655 AH), a historian and accomplished writer, authored the "Sharh Nahj al-Balaghah" in twenty parts. It covers history, literature, speech, and philosophy, expressing his expertise in Islamic sciences. He transmitted information from Ahmad ibn Abdul Aziz al-Jawhari, the author of the book "Al-Saqifah,"⁶⁷ without alteration.

*"He mentioned his statement: 'I do not regret except for three things that I did and I wish I hadn't done them, and three things that I did not do and I wish I had done them, and three things I wish I had asked the Messenger of Allah (saw) about.' As for the three things that I did and wish I hadn't, I wish I had not opened the house of Fatimah, leaving it alone even if it closed for fighting."*⁶⁸

He also said in another place, quoting al-Qadi Abdul-Jabbar: *'As for the narration of the burning, if it is authentic, it is not a criticism of Umar because he had the right to threaten those who refused allegiance as an intention to dispute the caliphate among the Muslims.'*⁶⁹

Al-Juwayni and his Kitab Fara'id al-Simtayn.

Ibrahim ibn Muhammad al-Hadid, known as Al-Juwayni (died in 722 AH), one of the mentors of Al-Dhahabi, who said about him: Imam, scholar, unique, pride of Islam, and leader of the religion.⁷⁰

It has been narrated in the book Fara'id al-Simtayn with the mentioned chain of transmission from Ibn Abbas that the Messenger of Allah (saw) was sitting one day when Al-Hasan (as) approached. Upon seeing him, the Prophet wept and said, 'Come to me, come to me my son,' and he continued to bring him closer until he placed him on his right thigh. Then Al-Hussein (as) approached, and when the Prophet saw him, he wept and said, 'Come to me, come to me my son,' and he continued to bring him closer until he placed him on his

⁶⁶ Mukhtasar Tarikh Dimashq: 13/122.

⁶⁷ The book "Al-Saqifah" by its author Ahmad ibn Abdul Aziz is the oldest and simplest book that discusses the events of the Saqifah with explanation and detail. Ibn Abi al-Hadid quoted it extensively in various parts of his book. If someone were to compile what he transmitted in the explanation of Nahj al-Balaghah, that book would return to the scene after being lost.

⁶⁸ Sharh Nahj al-Balagha: 2/46-47.

⁶⁹ Sharh Nahj al-Balagha: 16/272, and Al-Mua'lliq said: Al-Murtada reported it in Al-Shafi: 234-235.

⁷⁰ Mu'jam Shuyukh Al-Dhahabi: 125, Biography Number: 156.

left thigh. Then Fatimah (as) approached, and when he saw her, he wept and said, 'Come to me, come to me my daughter Fatimah,' and he seated her between his hands. Then Ali, the Commander of the Faithful (as), approached, and when the Prophet saw him, he wept and said, 'Come to me, come to me my brother,' and he continued to bring him closer until he sat him to his right side. His companions said to him, 'O Messenger of Allah! We do not see anyone among them except that you weep, or there is something special about them?' He (saw) said: 'By the One who sent me with Prophethood and chose me over all creation, indeed, I and they are the most honorable of creatures to Allah the Almighty, and there is no breath on the face of the earth dearer to me than theirs.' He continued, 'As for my daughter Fatimah, she is the mistress of the women of the worlds, from the ancients to the moderns. She is a part of me, the light of my eyes, the fruit of my heart, the soul between my sides, and she is the human heavenly maiden. When she stands in her prayer niche before her Lord, her light shines for the angels of the heavens, just as the light of the stars shines for the people of the earth. Allah the Almighty says to His angels, 'O My angels, look at my servant Fatimah, the mistress of my female servants, standing before Me, trembling in awe. She has turned her heart towards My worship. I bear witness to you that I have granted security to her Shia from the Fire.' When I saw her, I remembered what would happen to her after me, as if it had already happened. She will face humiliation in her house, her sanctity will be violated, her rights will be usurped, her inheritance will be denied, her side will be broken, and her unborn child will be miscarried. And she will call, 'O Muhammad!' but no one will answer her. She will cry for help, but no one will come to her aid.'"⁷¹

Al-Dhahabi and his Tarikh al-Islam

Shams al-Din Muhammad ibn Ahmad ibn Uthman al-Dhahabi (died 748 AH) says in his book Tarikh al-Islam:

*Alwan ibn Dawood al-Bajali narrated from Humayd ibn Abdul Rahman, from Saleh ibn Kaysan, from Humayd ibn Abdul Rahman ibn 'Awf, from his father. Al-Layth ibn Saad narrated it from Alwan, from Saleh himself. He said: I entered upon Abu Bakr to visit him during his illness, greeted him, and asked him how he was doing. He said: "Praise be to Allah, I am well," until he said: "Then he said: I do not regret anything except for three things I did, and three things I did not do, and three things I wish I had asked the Messenger of Allah (saw) about. I wish I did not uncover Fatima's house, and instead left it, even if they closed the door for war. I wish on the Day of the Saqifah of Banu Sa'ida to have thrown the matter on Umar or Abu Ubaidah."*⁷²

⁷¹ Fara'id al-Simtayn, vol. 2, pp. 34-35, Beirut edition

⁷² Tarikh al-Islam: 3/117-118.

Nur al-Din al-Haythami and his Majma' al-Zawa'id

The hadith scholar, Nur al-Din Ali ibn Abi Bakr al-Haythami (d. 807 AH), mentioned in his book *Majma' al-Zawa'id wa Daba' al-Fawa'id* under the chapter on the disapproval of allegiance and whom it is recommended for:

He narrated and said: Abdul Rahman ibn Auf reported, "I entered upon Abu Bakr during his illness before he passed away, greeted him, and asked him about his condition. He sat up and said, 'I am well, thanks to Allah,' until he said, 'I do not regret anything except for three things I did and wish I hadn't, and three things I didn't do and wish I had, and three things I wish I had asked the Messenger of Allah (saw) about. As for the three things I wish I hadn't done, I wish I hadn't uncovered Fatimah's house and left it, even if they closed the door for war. I wish that on the day of the Saqifah of Bani Sa'ida, I threw the responsibility on the neck of the two men, Abu Ubaidah or Umar, and one of them became the Amir al-Mu'minin (Commander of the Faithful) and I the minister."¹⁷³

Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani and his Lisan al-Mizan

In another narration by Imam Shihab al-Din Abu al-Fadl, known as al-Asqalani (d. 852 AH), in his book *Lisan al-Mizan* with his chain of narration from Humayd ibn Abdul Rahman ibn 'Awf from his father:

"I entered upon Abu Bakr during his illness; he sat up and I said, 'How are you this morning?' Abu Bakr replied, 'I am well, thanks to Allah.' Then Abu Bakr said, 'As you see me, I don't grieve over anything except for three things: I wish I hadn't done them. I wish I hadn't uncovered Fatimah's house and left it, even if they closed the door for war. I wish that on the day of the Saqifah, I threw the responsibility on the neck of either Abu Ubaidah or Umar and one of them became the Amir al-Mu'minin and I the minister.'"¹⁷⁴

Al-Muttaqi al-Hindi and his Kanz al-'Ummaal

'Alaa al-Din al-Muttaqi al-Hindi (died in 975 AH) narrated in *Kanz al-Ummal* the hadith of Abdul Rahman bin 'Awf in a detailed manner, saying:

Abdul Rahman bin 'Awf reported that Abu Bakr al-Siddiq said to him on his deathbed: "Verily, I do not regret anything except for three things I have done and wished I had not done, and three things I have not done and wished I had done. Three things I wish I had asked the Messenger of Allah about. As for the three things I have done and wish I had not done, I wish I had not unveiled the house of Fatimah and left it, even if they had closed it for war..."¹⁷⁵

⁷³ *Majma' al-Zawa'id*: 5/202-203.

⁷⁴ *Lisan al-Mizan*, 4/188-189.

⁷⁵ *Kanz al-Ummal*, 5/631, Hadith Number 14113.

Abdul Fattah Abdul Maqsud and the book "Imam Ali, peace be upon him"

Abdul Fattah, the author of the book "Imam Ali – Peace be upon him," is one of the talented writers of the present era. He exerted great effort, persevered, and devoted substantial efforts, extracting the essence of radiant truths. With this book, he rendered commendable service, and he mentioned in the incident of the house:

Umar said, 'By the One in whose hand is my soul, I will make them come out, or I will burn it with those inside.'" A group, fearing Allah and mindful of the Messenger in his aftermath, said to him, "O Abu Hafs, indeed in it is Fatima." He replied boldly, "So what?" He approached, knocked on the door, then struck it and forcefully entered... and Ali appeared to him. At that moment, the voice of Zahra rang out at the entrance of the house. It was nothing but a cry for help she released, saying, "O father, Messenger of Allah!" with which she prepared to seek refuge in the proximity of her resting place in the pleasure of her Lord from the aggression of her companion until the arrogant one's severity changed. His tyranny dissipated, and his aggression and arrogance melted away. He wished he could disappear in humiliation, as if lightning struck him, and the edges of his garment returned to him. When the crowd dispersed and he began to flee like scattered gazelles before the cry of Zahra, Ali turned his eyes in sorrow. His dream had faded, his worries deepened, and his right hand clenched the hilt of his sword, as if out of anger that it might plunge into it.⁷⁶

Regarding historical documents:

There are historical documents that reveal the injustices, cruelty, and violation of rights that make humanity shudder.

Document One: The protest of Urwa ibn al-Zubayr against the actions of the caliph to justify the deeds of his brother Abdullah, who gathered wood to burn the Banu Hashim.

Document Two: A letter from Yazid ibn Muawiya to Abdullah ibn Umar.

Document Three: The sayings narrated by al-Bukhari in the book Al-Khums wa Al-Maghazi.

Document Four: The eloquent speech of Fatimah al-Zahraa (peace be upon her) delivered in a grand gathering that included both Muhajireen and Ansar.

3) Historical documents

⁷⁶ Abdul Fattah Abdul Maqsud: "Imam Ali – Peace be upon him": 4/274-277. He has another statement on this subject, refer to Part 1/192-193, which we have not included here for the sake of brevity.

The information we have mentioned from various sources is sufficient to prove the intended meaning. Even if we add what Shi'ite historians and scholars have mentioned about the events of Saqifah, the matter becomes among the well-established and necessary facts that anyone familiar with history would not doubt.

In the early ages of Islamic affairs, the issue was significant to the extent that some individuals, even those whose hands were stained with the blood of Muslims, began justifying their actions by the actions of the caliph. Here are these historical documents.

The first document

Al-Mas'udi narrated, "Ibn al-Zubayr approached Mecca from the Bani Hashim tribe. He confined them in the Shu'ab (districts) and gathered a vast amount of firewood for them. If a spark of fire were to fall on it, no one would escape death. Among the people was Muhammad bin al-Hanafiya."

Then, he continued, "Al-Nawfali reported in his book al-Akhbar, from Ibn 'Aisha, from his father, from Hammad bin Salama, who said, 'Urwah bin al-Zubayr used to defend his brother when the mention of the Bani Hashim came up, and when he confined them in the Shu'ab and gathered firewood for them to burn. He used to say, 'He only intended to terrorize them so that they would submit to him when they refused allegiance, as in the past.' This is a story that cannot be mentioned here, and we have discussed it in our book on the virtues of the People of the House and their reports in the book 'Hada'iq al-Azhan.'"⁷⁷

Ibn Abi al-Hadid also transmitted it and said, "Urwah bin al-Zubayr used to defend his brother Abdullah in confining the Bani Hashim in the Shu'ab and gathering firewood to burn them. He used to say, 'He only intended for that so that the word does not spread, and Muslims do not differ, and they enter into obedience, so that the word becomes one, just as Umar bin al-Khattab did with the Bani Hashim when they delayed allegiance to Abu Bakr. He brought firewood to burn their house.'"⁷⁸

The second document

Al-Baladhuri narrated, saying: When Al-Hussein, peace be upon him, was killed, Abdullah bin Umar wrote to Yazid bin Muawiyah: "After this, the grief has become immense, and the calamity has reached its peak. A great event has occurred in Islam, and there is no day like the day when Al-Hussein was killed."

So Yazid wrote to him: "After this, O fool, we have come to newly built houses, with spread carpets, and well-prepared cushions. We fought for them; if the truth is with us, then

⁷⁷ Muruj al-Dhahab, 3/77, Dar al-Andalus edition.

⁷⁸ Sharh Nahj al-Balagha, 20/147.

we fought for our right. And if the truth is with others, then your father was the first to violate this, and he seized the right from its rightful owners."⁷⁹

The third document

Certainly, there are clear indications and evidence that unmistakably point to the fact that the Lady of the Worlds experienced bitter incidents after the departure of her father, incidents caused by the one who assumed the platform of caliphate. The following matters serve as evidence:

A. Fatimah distanced herself from Abu Bakr and did not speak to him until she passed away.

Imam al-Bukhari narrated in his book Al-Khums: "Fatimah, the daughter of the Messenger of Allah, was angered, so she distanced herself from Abu Bakr and continued her distancing until she passed away."⁸⁰

He also narrated in the book of Al-Farai'd and said: "Fatimah distanced herself from him (Abu Bakr), and she did not speak to him until she passed away."⁸¹

In the book Al-Maghazi in the chapter on the Battle of Khaybar, it is mentioned: "Fatimah found Abu Bakr, so she distanced herself from him and did not speak to him until she passed away."⁸²

What do you think of the narrations reported by Imam al-Bukhari? This is nothing but because her sanctity was violated, to the point she fled to her father's grave, saying:

'What does it matter to the one who has smelt the dust of Ahmad's grave

That they should never smell the finest perfumes?

Calamities have been poured on me

Had they been poured on days they would have turned into eternal nights.⁸³

B. When Ali prepared Fatimah al-Zahra and entrusted her to her grave, grief overwhelmed him.

⁷⁹ Nahj al-Haqq wa Kashf al-Sidq:356, commented on by Faraj Allah Al-Husayni, Maktabat Al-Madrassa. Taken from Al-Ansab by Al-Baladhuri.

⁸⁰ Sahih al-Bukhari: 4/42, Dar al-Fikr, Beirut.

⁸¹ Sahih al-Bukhari: 8/30, Dar al-Fikr, Beirut.

⁸² Sahih al-Bukhari: 5/82, Dar al-Fikr, Beirut.

⁸³ Wafa' al-Wafaa: 2/444.

He addressed the Messenger, peace and blessings be upon him, and said:

"Your daughter will inform you of the oppression that your Ummah inflicted upon her. Question her closely and inquire about her condition. This is while the covenant has not been broken, and your remembrance has not faded away."⁸⁴

All of this indicates that she, peace be upon her, died wronged, oppressed, deprived of her rights.

C. She was buried at night according to her instructions. What is the secret behind this instruction?

Al-Baladhuri, after mentioning the chain of narration, said: Ali buried Fatimah, peace be upon her, at night. He continued until he said: Fatimah, peace be upon her, instructed that she be carried on a pure bed. Asma bint 'Umays said to her, "Make for yourself a coffin as I have seen the people of Abyssinia make." So, she sent for a moist palm tree branch and cut it. Then, she made a coffin for her. Fatimah smiled, and she had not smiled since the death of the Prophet, peace and blessings be upon him and his family, except at that moment. She was washed by Ali, Asma, and with that, she made her will. Abu Bakr and Umar were unaware of her death.⁸⁵

The fourth document: The sermon of al-Zahraa (as) after the demise of her father

From what indicates that she died oppressed, wronged, deprived of her rights is her well-known sermon, which is characterized by utmost clarity, eloquence, strength of argument, and is among the virtues of speeches and their masterpieces. It carries a touch of the light of prophethood and has the fragrance of the essence of the message. The compilers, both supporters and opponents, have included it, and its chain of narration will be presented to you at the end of the sermon.

Historians and narrators have reported that when Abu Bakr and Umar unanimously agreed to prevent Fatimah, the daughter of the Messenger of Allah (may Allah bless him and his family), from her rightful inheritance, she covered herself in a veil, wore her headscarf, and wrapped herself in her cloak. She entered a gathering of her servants and the women of her tribe, dragging her long garments behind her. Her walk was like the walk of [her father] the Messenger of Allah (peace be upon him and his family).

She entered upon Abu Bakr while he was in the midst of a gathering of the Emigrants, the Helpers, and others. A sheet was spread out for her, and she sat down. Soon after, the people began to weep for her, and the gathering became agitated. When the tumult subsided and their emotions calmed, she began speaking, commencing with the

⁸⁴ Nahj al-Balagha: Sermon 202.

⁸⁵ Ansab al-Ashraf: 1/405.

praise of Allah, the Exalted, and blessings upon the Messenger of Allah (saw). The people resumed weeping. When they restrained themselves, she continued her speech. She, peace be upon her, said:

“Glory be to Allah for His great blessings, and gratitude to Him for that which He has inspired, and praise be to Him for what He has brought to pass. From the all-encompassing blessings that He grants to the ever-expansive grace that He bestows and all the bounties that He continuously confers. Its magnitude is greater than can be enumerated, its extent is beyond measure and its limit is beyond comprehension. He has invited the people to express their gratitude in order to seek its increase and continuity, called upon them to praise Him by augmenting it and followed up by bidding them to ask for more of its like [in the Hereafter].

I bear witness that there is no god but Allah, alone, having no partners - a statement the inner meaning of which has been defined as sincerity, its means have been instilled in the hearts and its meaning gleams in the minds. He cannot be perceived by sight, described by words or depicted by imaginations. He originated everything from nothing that existed before, and created everything without following any previous model. He fashioned everything with His power and made it all with His will, without any need for bringing it into being or any possible benefit that could come from forming it; only the affirmation of His wisdom, the proclamation of His obedience, the manifestation of His power, the servility of His subjects and the exaltation of His call. Then He placed reward in obedience and punishment in disobedience to Him, in order to turn His servants away from His chastisement and urge them towards His Paradise.

I bear witness that my father, Muhammad, is His servant and Prophet. He chose him even before sending him [with the Message], named him before picking him [for prophethood] and selected him before appointing him [as a Messenger] - at a time when the creation was hidden in the unknown, covered by the curtain of uncertainty and close to the edge of non- existence - out of the knowledge of Allah, the Most High, about the final outcome of every matter, the complete awareness of events that will transpire and cognizance of the end of all affairs. Allah sent him in order to complete His mission, establish His order and execute His mercy. He found the people divided in their beliefs, secluded around their sacred fires, worshiping their idols and denying Allah, despite having intrinsic knowledge about Him. So, through my father Muhammad (S), Allah illuminated their darkness, removed the ambivalence from their hearts and illuminated the obscurity of their sight. He rose among the people with guidance, saved them from perversion, removed their [spiritual] blindness, led them to the right faith and called them towards the straight path. Then Allah took him back with kindness and election, affinity and preference.

Thus Muhammad (S) is now in ease and comfort, [free] from the hardships of this world, surrounded by the blameless angels and the pleasure of the Forgiving Lord, in the company of the Almighty King. May Allah bless my father, His Prophet, the custodian of His revelation, His chosen servant, the one whom He selected from all His creatures and whom He is most pleased with. Peace, blessings and mercy of Allah be upon him.”

Then she turned to the people who were present in the gathering and said:

“You are the servants of Allah, the recipients of His commandments and prohibitions, the bearers of His religion and revelation and the trustees of Allah over your souls. You are the propagators of His message to all people. His true proxy is present among you, as the legacy that he (the Prophet) bequeathed and left behind with you, giving it authority over you - the Articulate Book of Allah, the True Qur’an, the Radiant Light, the Effulgent Illumination - with proofs that are manifest and mysteries that are evident. Its apparent message is clear and those who follow it are envied. Those who adhere to it are led to Allah’s pleasure and those who heed to it are saved. Through it the enlightened proofs of Allah, His explicative verdicts, His forewarned prohibitions, His unambiguous statements, His sufficient evidence, His mandated virtues, His bestowed leniency and His ordained laws, are attained.

Allah made faith (Iman) as a means to purify yourselves from polytheism, prayer (Salat) a means of freeing yourselves from arrogance, the poor-rate (Zakat) a means of cleansing the soul and increasing sustenance, fasting (Siyam) a means of establishing sincerity, pilgrimage (Hajj) a means of upraising the religion, justice a means for maintaining harmony of the hearts, obedience to us (the Ahl al-Bayt) a means of maintaining order in the community, our leadership (Imamah) as a security from disunity, holy struggle (Jihad) as a glory for Islam, patience as an aid in making one deserving of recompense, enjoining good (amr bil-ma’ruf) as a reformation for the masses, honoring parents a means of protection from [divine] wrath, keeping ties with family a means of increasing your numbers, sanctioned retaliation (Qisas) a means of preventing bloodshed, fulfilling promises a means of earning forgiveness, honesty in weighing and measurement a means of avoiding diminution, forbidding the drinking of wine a means of becoming free of filth, eschewing defamation as a screen against imprecation and shunning theft a means of maintaining virtue. He prohibited polytheism in order to make His Lordship exclusive, **“so observe your duty to Allah with the dutifulness due to Him, and do not die except as Muslims.” [3:102]** **“Obey Allah in that which He has commanded and forbidden, for indeed only those who possess knowledge fear Allah.” [35:28]**”

Then she continued:

“O People, know that I am Fatimah and my father is Muhammad (S). I say again to you, and what I am saying is not false and what I am doing is not in transgression. **“There has certainly come to you a messenger from among yourselves; grievous to him is your distress; he is full of concern for you, and compassionate and merciful to the believers.” [9:128]** So if you honor him and know him, you will realize that he is my father and not the father of anyone amongst your women. He is the bother of my cousin [and husband], and not of any of your men. How excellent it is to be related to him. He propagated the message, warned the people openly, and turned against the ways of the polytheists, breaking their backs and strangling their throats. He called [them] to the way of his Lord **“with wisdom and good advice.” [16:125]** He broke the idols and struck the heads, until they were defeated and forced to flee. Then night gave way to day and the pure truth shone forth. The leader of

faith spoke and the camel-frothings of the devils were silenced. The servants of hypocrisy perished and the knots of disbelief and schism were undone.

You uttered the words of faith in the presence of the bright-faced and empty-of-stomach, while you were on ***“the brink of a fiery pit.” [3:103]***. A mere draught for the drinker and opportunity for the lustful [were you]. A flickering flame and a treading ground for others [were you]. You would drink from polluted water and eat dried animal skins and leaves. Abased and spurned, you feared being dispossessed by those around you.

Then Allah, the Almighty, rescued you through Muhammad (S), after all these calamities and after suffering at the hands of barbarians, the wolfish Arabs, and the rebellious People of the Book. ***“Whenever they ignited the flame of war, Allah extinguished it.” [5:64]*** Whenever the horn of Satan appeared or the polytheist’s maw opened [in defiance], he would dispatch his brother [‘Ali (‘a)] into its midst and he would not return until he had trampled on its ear with the soles of his feet and put out its blaze with his sword.

He strove for the sake of Allah and struggled in the way of Allah. He was close to the Prophet of Allah, a leader among the friends of Allah, always prepared and diligent, sincere, earnest and hardworking - never fearing the reproach of any reproacher. Meanwhile, you were living lives of ease and comfort; relaxed, unperturbed and secure, awaiting the reversal of our fortunes, keenly waiting for news [of our failures], retreating during conflict and fleeing from battle.

So when Allah chose to take His Prophet to the abode of His Prophets and the dwelling of His sincere servants, the thorny tree of hypocrisy appeared amongst you and the robe of religion became ragged. The misguided, who were previously silent, began to speak, the unknown few arose, and the liars came forward, braying [like camels] as they strutted, wagging their tails in your courtyards. Satan raised his head from his hiding place and called out to you. He found you responsive to his call and attentive to his deception. Then he enticed you and found you easy to arouse; he exasperated you and found you easy to anger. So you branded camels that were not yours and proceeded to other than your own watering holes. This, while the era [of the Prophet] had only just ended, the gash was still wide and the wound still fresh. The Prophet had yet to be buried when you made haste, claiming that you were afraid of dissension; ***“Lo, they have fallen into dissension! And indeed Hell surrounds the unbelievers.” [9:49]*** Far be it! What is wrong with you? And where are you heading to while the Book of Allah is in your midst? Its affairs are distinct, its rulings manifest, its signs radiant, its prohibitions evident and its commands are clear. Yet you have cast it behind your backs. Do you wish to turn away from it out of aversion? Or do you wish to judge by another [book]? ***“Evil would be the exchange for the wrongdoers!” p18:50*** ***“And whoever seeks a religion other than Islam, then it will not be accepted from him and he will be among the losers in the Hereafter.” p3:85***

Then you only waited for as long as it took the feral [camel] to calm down and accept a rider taking control of its reins before reigniting its flames and kindling its embers. You have responded to the cries of the misguiding Satan and have attempted to extinguish the

lights of the splendid religion and suppress the teachings of the pure Prophet. You secretly drank the milk while pretending to sip the froth and stalked his family and children, hiding in the trees and trenches, yet we endure patiently with you through what feels like the stabbing of daggers and the piercing of [our] sides with spearheads. And now you claim that we have no inheritance! ***“Do they seek the judgment of [the age of] ignorance? And who is a better judge than Allah for the people who have certainty?” [5:50]*** Do you know not? Indeed, it is as obvious as the midday sun that I am his daughter! O Muslims, will I be denied my inheritance?!

O Son of Abu Quhafah, is it in the Book of Allah that you may inherit from your father yet I cannot inherit from mine? ***“You have certainly come up with a strange thing!” [19:27]*** Have you purposely abandoned the Book of Allah and cast it behind your backs? When it says: ***“And Sulayman inherited from Dawud” [27:16]*** and when relating the story of Yahya ibn Zakariyya, where he (Zakariyya) said: ***“So grant me from Yourself an heir who will inherit from me and inherit from the family of Ya`qub” [19:5-6]*** and it further states: ***“...but blood relatives are more entitled [to inherit] from one another in the Book of Allah” [8:75]*** and: ***“Allah enjoins you concerning your children: for the male shall be the like of the share of two females” [4:11]*** and: ***“...if he leaves behind any property, he should make a bequest for his parents and relatives in kindness, an obligation for the Godway” [2:180]*** yet you claim that I have no entitlement and inherit nothing from my father?!

Has Allah revealed a special verse [of the Qur`an] for you from which He excluded my father? Or do you say that people of two separate faiths cannot inherit from one another? Are my father and I not upon the same faith? Or is it that you have greater knowledge of the particular and general injunctions of the Qur`an than my father and cousin? So take hold of its reins, muzzled and saddled, for it will surely meet you on the day you are assembled; and Allah is the best judge and Muhammad the best leader. The [final] rendezvous is on the Day of Resurrection, and when it comes, the falsifiers will be the losers and your remorse will be of no benefit. ***“For every tiding there is an appointed term” [6:67]*** ***“Soon you will know whom a disgraceful punishment will overtake and on whom a lasting punishment will descend.” [11:39]”***

Then addressing the Ansar, she said:

“O people of understanding, supporters of faith and defenders of Islam, what is [the cause of] this negligence in defending my rights and laxity before the injustice being done to me? Did my father, the Prophet of Allah (S), not say: “A man is honored through his offspring”? How quickly have you changed, and how hastily have you betrayed us, while you possess the ability to assist me and the strength to support me in what I seek and pursue.

Do you say: “Muhammad (S) has died”? This is indeed a grave matter whose damage is extensive, its breach is vast and its weavings have been rent apart. The world has become dark by his absence; the sun and moon have been eclipsed and the stars scattered because of his loss, hopes have been dashed, mountains have crumbled, sanctities have been violated and all that is sacred has been disregarded upon his death. This is, by Allah, a great tribulation and a dire calamity, no tribulation can be compared to it and no adversity is as

grievous. The Book of Allah – glory be to Him – announced it in your courtyards, in your evenings and mornings, calling and crying out, recited and chanted, that the Prophets of Allah and His Messengers who came before were not able to overcome the definitive verdict and the inescapable decree [of death]. ***“And Muhammad is but a messenger, other messengers have passed away before him. If he dies or is slain, will you turn back on your heels? Anyone who turns back on his heels will not harm Allah in the least, and soon Allah will reward the grateful.” [3:144]***

Far be it, O Children of Qaylah! Will I be deprived of my patrimony while you watch and listen to me? And [while you] are seated and gathered here? You are involved in the claim and are aware of it, and you are numerous and well equipped, you possess means and strength, and own weapons and shields. The case has reached you, yet you do not respond. You hear the cry, yet you do not assist me. Yet you are known for your bravery and have a reputation for being good and righteous; you are an elite group and the best of those who were selected. You fought the [pagan] Arabs and bore pains and hardships. You clashed with the nations and battled the champions. We have not ceased, or is it you, who have ceased? You always complied; we ordered and you obeyed. Until, through us, Islam was established and the milk of prosperity began to flow, the breach of polytheism was subdued, the ebullition of falsehood subsided, the fires of disbelief were stifled, the call to rebellion was silenced and the religious order was founded.

So why have you become confused after your clear stance? Why have you become secretive after your proclamation? Why have you retreated after being at the forefront? And why have you opted for polytheism after believing [in Allah]? ***“Will you not make war on a people who broke their pledges and resolved to expel the Messenger, while they attacked you first? Do you fear them? But Allah is worthier of being feared by you, should you be faithful.” [9:13]***

Lo, I see you now inclined to a life of ease, having distanced yourselves from the one who is more worthy of giving and withholding. You have withdrawn into comfort and have escaped from hardship to abundance. You have thus spit out what you had retained and vomited out what you had swallowed. ***“If you are ungrateful, you and those on earth all together, most surely Allah is Self-sufficient, Praised.” [14:8]***

I have said what I had to say, being fully aware of your intention to forsake me and of the betrayal that has sprung in your hearts. But this was the unbosoming of the soul, the outburst of anger, the inability to further endure, the expression of the heart and the advancing of proof. So, take its reins and saddle it, with its sore back and suppurating hooves, ever disgraceful, branded with the wrath of Allah and eternal dishonor, leading to ***“the fire, set ablaze by Allah, that roars over the hearts” [104:6-7]***, for what you are doing is witnessed by Allah, ***“and they who act unjustly shall know to what final place of turning they shall turn back.” [26:227]*** I am the daughter of ***“a warner unto you, before a severe chastisement” [34:46]*** So act, we too shall act, ***“and wait, we too shall wait.” [11:122]***

After having heard this, Abu Bakr said:

“O daughter of the Messenger of Allah! Your father was indeed affectionate, generous, gracious and merciful to the believers, and the disbelievers shall face painful chastisement and severe retribution. If we look at his relationships, we find that he was your father to the exclusion of other women, and the brother of your husband to the exclusion of all [his] other close companions. He preferred him over every close friend and he, on his part, assisted him in every important matter. None love you save the felicitous and none despise you save the wretched. You are the pure progeny of the Messenger of Allah, the best of the chosen ones, our guides towards virtue and our path to Paradise. And you, O best of all women and daughter of the best of Prophets, are true in your words and foremost in the prodigiousness of your intellect. You will not be denied your right nor will your truth be contested.

By Allah, I have never opposed the opinion of the Messenger of Allah, and have never done anything but by his permission. The herald does not lie to his people; I take Allah as my witness, and He suffices as a witness, that I heard the Messenger of Allah (S) say: “We, the company of Prophets, neither bequeath gold nor silver, nor houses nor land; we only bequeath the Book, wisdom, knowledge and prophethood, and whatever we possess of [revenue generating] property, it is for the ruler who comes after us to dispense with according to his own judgment.” And we have already spent what you are asking for, to procure horses and weapons that the Muslims may use in battle, to fight against the unbelievers and quash the insurgency of rebels. This was done by the consensus of all the Muslims; I did not make this decision alone and I never enforced my opinion on anyone.

This is my state and my wealth, it is at your disposal and I place it before you. Nothing will be withheld from you and nothing will be kept from you. You are the noblewoman of your father’s nation and a pure [maternal] tree for your children. Your merits cannot be disputed, and your honorable lineage and roots cannot be disparaged. Your command with respect to what I possess shall be enforced. Do you think I should act against the will of your father (saw) in this matter?”

She replied:

“Praise be to Allah! My father, the Messenger of Allah (S), never turned away from the Book of Allah, nor did he oppose its injunctions. Rather, he followed its directives and abided by its lofty teachings. Do you add on to your treachery by ascribing falsehood to him? And this [plot] after his death is similar to the pernicious plots that were staged against him during his lifetime. Here is the Book of Allah, a just adjudicator and a decisive articulator, [clearly] saying: **“[An heir] who may inherit from me and inherit from the House of Ya ‘qub” [19:6]** and **“Sulayman inherited from Dawud...” [27:16]** And the Almighty clarified how the shares are to be allotted and legislated the laws of [filial] obligation and inheritance, prescribing the proper share of males and females, thereby removing the excuse of the falsifiers and eliminating suspicions and doubts in those left behind. No, **“but your souls have made the matter seem decorous for you; yet patience is beautiful, and Allah is the one whose help is sought against what you allege.” [12:18]**

Abu Bakr replied:

“Allah spoke the truth and so did his Prophet. And his daughter has also spoken the truth. You are indeed a source of wisdom, a fountainhead of guidance and mercy, a pillar of faith and a wellspring of proof. I do not repudiate your apposite speech, nor do I reject what you say. These Muslims in front of us are the ones who compelled me to accept what I have accepted and it is by their unanimity that I took what I did; neither by coercion, nor obstinacy, nor self-importance and they are all witnesses to this.”

Fatimah (as) then turned to the people and said:

“O people who hasten towards false speech! O those who are complacent with the ugly action that will bring ruin! **“Do they not reflect on the Qur’an or are there locks on the hearts?” [47:24]** No, rather your hearts have become rusted by the evil that you have done. Thus your hearing and sight have been taken away and you have gravely misinterpreted it (the Qur’an); how wrongly you have referred to it, and how evil is your construal from it. By Allah, you will surely find its burden heavy and its consequence dire, when the veil is lifted and the great adversity that follows becomes evident to you, and there will appear to you from your Lord what you never reckoned, **“it is then that those who stood by falsehood will be the losers.” [40:78]**

Finally, she turned to face the grave of the Holy Prophet (S) and recited the following couplets:

*After you [passed away], reports and chaos followed,
Had you been present, tribulations would not abound
We miss you just as parched land misses its rain,
And your nation is confused, see how they have turned around
Every family has relatives but the position
before God, is for those with the greatest proximity [to you]
People manifested against us what was hidden in their hearts,
As soon as you departed and the barrier of dust separated us from you
They frowned at us and insulted us
when you were gone, and all the land was usurped
You were a full moon and an illuminating light
from the Almighty, upon you was the book revealed
Jibra’ il would comfort us with the verses he brought,
But now you are not here and all goodness has disappeared*

*O how I wish death would have come to us before you,
When you passed and were, by the dune, from us covered*

Chains of narration for the Sermon:

The narration of the sermon has been reported by more than one narrator among the traditionists and historians, and here are some that we have come across in historical order:

1) Abu al-Fadl Ahmad ibn Abi Tahir (204-280 AH)

Imam Abu al-Fadl stated in the book "Balaghat al-Nisa": I mentioned to Abu al-Husayn Zayd ibn Ali ibn al-Husayn⁸⁶ ibn Ali ibn Abi Talib, may Allah's blessings be upon them, the words of Fatimah (peace be upon her) when Abu Bakr prevented her from her rightful inheritance, and I said to him, "These people claim that it is fabricated and that it is from the speech of Abu al-Aynaa, 'News is hung on eloquence rather than mere words.'"⁸⁷

He said to me, "I have seen the elders of the family of Abu Talib narrating it from their forefathers and teaching it to their children. My father narrated it to me from my grandfather, who heard it from Fatimah (peace be upon her) about this story. The Shia scholars have narrated it and discussed it among themselves before the birth of Abu al-Aynaa's grandfather. Al-Hasan ibn Alwan narrated it from Atiyya al-Aufi that he heard Abdullah ibn al-Hasan mention it from his father. Then Abu al-Husayn said, 'How can they reject this narration from the speech of Fatimah while they narrate from the speech of Aisha, which is more astonishing than Fatimah's speech? They confirm it if it were not for their animosity towards us, the Ahl al-Bayt.' Then he mentioned the hadith, saying:

When Abu Bakr, may Allah have mercy on him, decided to prevent Fatimah, the daughter of the Messenger of Allah, may Allah's peace and blessings be upon him and his family, from her share, and the news reached Fatimah, she wore her veil on her head and joined a gathering of her supporters...⁸⁸

2) Abu Bakr Ahmad ibn Abdul Aziz al-Jawhari (died 323 AH)

He narrated the entire sermon in his book "Al-Saqifa" on pages 97-101. It has been narrated by more than one prominent figure, such as Ibn Abi al-Hadid in his commentary on Nahj al-Balagha and al-Irbili in Kashf al-Ghummah, as will be explained to you.

3) Al-Sharif Al-Murtada (355 - 436 AH)

⁸⁶ It is possible to imagine the existence of a gap in the chain of transmission because the author of Balaghat did not meet Zaid the Martyr (A'yan al-Shi'a: 1/315). It is also possible that Abu al-Husayn is referring to Zaid al-Asghar, who was a companion of al-Hadi. See Tahdhib al-Tahdhib: 30/420 and Irshad al-Mufid, p. 332. Note the comment by al-Shafi'i in al-Sayyid Abdul Zahra al-Husayni al-Khatib: 4/76.

⁸⁷ It means that the criticism is directed at attributing this eloquent speech to Fatimah (peace be upon her). However, the incident itself, regarding the denial of inheritance, is authentic and documented in historical books.

⁸⁸ Balaghat al-Nisa: 32-33.

Al-Sharif Al-Murtada said in responding to Al-Qadi Abdul-Jabbar, the author of Al-Mughni: Most narrators who are not accused of bias or Shiite inclinations narrated, after her departure from the position of dispute and demand, words from her (peace be upon her) indicating her displeasure and anger. We mention from that what supports our statement.

Abu Abdullah Muhammad ibn Imran Al-Marzubani informed us, saying: [Muhammad ibn Ahmed Al-Katib informed me], Ahmed ibn Ubaid ibn Naseh Al-Nahwi informed us, Al-Ziyadi told us, Al-Sharqi ibn Al-Qatami narrated to us, from Muhammad ibn Ishaq who said: Salih ibn Kaysan informed us, from Urwah, from Aisha.

Al-Marzubani said: Abu Bakr Ahmed ibn Muhammad Al-Makki informed us, saying: Abu Al-Ayna Muhammad ibn Al-Qasim Al-Simami informed us, saying: Ibn Aisha informed us, saying: When the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings be upon him and his family) passed away, Fatimah (peace be upon her) approached Abu Bakr in a gathering of her supporters, in the first narration.

Aisha said: When Fatimah (peace be upon her) heard Abu Bakr's unanimous decision to prevent her from Fadak, she took her headscarf and covered her head, wrapped herself in her cloak, and approached in a gathering of her supporters. [Then the two narrations converge here] and the women of her tribe followed her, their tails trailing behind them, walking like the walking of the Messenger of Allah (saw) until she entered upon Abu Bakr, who was in a gathering of the Muhajireen, Ansar, and others. She spread a mat under her, and the people wept for her, and the assembly trembled. Then she waited a while until the people's sobbing subsided and their commotion calmed. She began her speech by praising Allah the Almighty and commending Him and sending blessings upon His Messenger (peace and blessings be upon him and his family). Then she said:...⁸⁹

4) Muhammad ibn Ali ibn Al-Hussein Al-Saduq (306 - 381 AH)

Sheikh Al-Saduq mentioned in the Ma'ani al-Akhbar another sermon whose content is similar to that sermon⁹⁰, narrated by him through two chains.

5) Muhammad ibn al-Hasan al-Tusi (385-460 AH)

The sheikh of the sect, Muhammad ibn al-Hasan al-Tusi, mentioned in his famous work, the ten-volume exegesis titled "al-Tibyan fi Tafseer al-Quran," in his narrations about another sermon in his Amali (sessions). The content of this sermon is close to that of the mentioned sermon, with its chain of narration going back to Al-Haffar. He said: "Al-Da'abli informed us, who said: Ahmad ibn Ali al-Khazzaz informed us, who said: Abu Sahl al-Rifa informed us, who said: Abdul Razzaq informed us." Al-Da'abli continued: "Abu Ya'qub, Ishaq ibn Ibrahim al-Deeri, informed us, who said: Abdul Razzaq informed us, who said: Ma'mar reported to us from Al-Zuhri, from Ubaidullah ibn Abdullah, from 'Utba ibn Mas'ud, from Ibn

⁸⁹ Al-Shafi fi Al-Imamah: 4/69-77.

⁹⁰ Ma'ani al-Akhbar: 354.

Abbas, who said: Some women from the Muhajireen (immigrants) and the Ansar entered..."⁹¹

6) Ibn Abu al-Hadid (died 655 AH)

The historian and researcher narrated in his commentary on Nahj al-Balagha from the book of al-Saqifah by Abu Bakr al-Jawhari, saying:

Abu Bakr said: Muhammad ibn Zakariya informed me, he said: Ja'far ibn Muhammad ibn 'Umarah al-Kindi narrated to me, he said: My father narrated to me from Husayn ibn Salih ibn Hayy, he said: Two men from the Banu Hashim narrated to me, from Zaynab, the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib (peace be upon him). He said: Ja'far ibn Muhammad ibn Ali ibn al-Husayn narrated from his father. Abu Bakr said: Uthman ibn Imran al-Ajifi narrated to me, from Na'il ibn Najih ibn 'Umair ibn Shamir, from Jabir al-Ju'fi, from Abu Ja'far Muhammad ibn Ali (peace be upon him). Abu Bakr said: Ahmad ibn Muhammad ibn Yazid narrated to me, from Abdullah ibn Muhammad ibn Sulaiman, from his father, from Abdullah ibn Hasan ibn al-Hasan. They all said: When Fatimah (peace be upon her) reached the consensus of Abu Bakr to prevent her from Fadak, she put on her veil and entered a gathering of her helpers and the women of her people. She walked in their midst, with a walk resembling the walk of the Messenger of Allah (saw), until she entered upon Abu Bakr...⁹²

7) Abu al-Hasan al-Irbili (died 693 AH)

Abu al-Hasan Ali ibn Isa ibn Abi al-Fath al-Irbili narrated in the book "Kashf al-Ghummah" and said: "As the discussion has reached this point, let us mention the sermon of Fatima, peace be upon her. It has been reported by the agreeable and the dissenters, and I have conveyed it from the book 'Al-Saqifah,' authored by Abu Bakr Ahmed ibn Abdul Aziz al-Jawhari from an old copy read by its author. I read it to him in the month of Rabi' al-Akhir in the year two hundred and twenty-three. Its men were narrators through various chains that Fatima, peace be upon her, upon learning of Abu Bakr's consensus to prevent her Fadak, put on her veil, joined a gathering of her helpers and the women of her people."⁹³

Let us limit ourselves to this extent of the chain of transmission. If we were to delve into investigation, our words would be lengthy, and our stance with the narrators would be prolonged.

And we conclude the message with peace upon the truthful martyr,

whose inheritance is snatched away, whose rib is broken,

whose husband is wronged, whose son is killed.

Peace, with no beginning and no end.

Ja'far Sobhani

⁹¹ Amali al-Tusi: 384, the thirteenth session.

⁹² Sharh Nahj al-Balagha, Ibn Abi al-Hadid: 16/211.

⁹³ Kashf al-Ghummah: 1/108-116.